

Canadian
Forces
College

Collège
des
Forces
Canadiennes



CAF's Strategic Movement Control Framework: A Valid Attempt But Under-Resourced

Major Kevin Brown

JCSP 49

Service Paper

Disclaimer

Opinions expressed remain those of the author and do not represent Department of National Defence or Canadian Forces policy. This paper may not be used without written permission.

© His Majesty the King in Right of Canada, as represented by the Minister of National Defence, 2023.

PCEMI n° 49

Étude militaire

Avertissement

Les opinions exprimées n'engagent que leurs auteurs et ne reflètent aucunement des politiques du Ministère de la Défense nationale ou des Forces canadiennes. Ce papier ne peut être reproduit sans autorisation écrite.

© Sa Majesté le Roi du Chef du Canada, représenté par le ministre de la Défense nationale, 2023.

**CAF's Strategic Movement Control Framework:
A Valid Attempt, But Under-Resourced**

Major Kevin Brown

“This paper was written by a candidate attending the Canadian Forces College in fulfilment of one of the requirements of the Course of Studies. The paper is a scholastic document, and thus contains facts and opinions which the author alone considered appropriate and correct for the subject. It does not necessarily reflect the policy or the opinion of any agency, including the Government of Canada and the Canadian Department of National Defence. This paper may not be released, quoted or copied, except with the express permission of the Canadian Department of National Defence.”

« La présente étude a été rédigée par un stagiaire du Collège des Forces canadiennes pour satisfaire à l'une des exigences du cours. L'étude est un document qui se rapporte au cours et contient donc des faits et des opinions que seul l'auteur considère appropriés et convenables au sujet. Elle ne reflète pas nécessairement la politique ou l'opinion d'un organisme quelconque, y compris le gouvernement du Canada et le ministère de la Défense nationale du Canada. Il est défendu de diffuser, de citer ou de reproduire cette étude sans la permission expresse du ministère de la Défense nationale. »

CAF'S STRATEGIC MOVEMENT CONTROL FRAMEWORK: A VALID ATTEMPT BUT UNDER-RESOURCED

AIM

1. This service paper aims to identify that the Canadian Armed Forces (CAF) requires a strategic level Movement Control (Mov Con) capability that can execute its tasks along all Strategic Lines of Communication (SLOCs), for all modes of transportation, to provide efficient and effective use of limited transportation resources, thus enabling CAF activities at all levels.

INTRODUCTION

2. Transportation is a crucial resource for any modern military. As Winston Churchill stated "Victory is the beautiful, bright-colored flower. Transport is the stem without which it could never have blossomed."¹ The CAF is neglecting this stem through its lack of a strategic Mov Con capability. Given Canada's large geographic footprint, combined with its relatively long distance to most of the CAF's deployed theaters of operation, the CAF must place particular importance on the efficient use of its limited transportation resources.

3. This service paper will first outline what strategic movement is and demonstrate that the CAF conducts strategic movement regularly. Secondly, this paper will examine how the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) and other allied patterns conduct strategic level Mov Con as well as provide a brief overview of Canadian logistics doctrine. Thirdly, it will identify key elements of the CAF's current Mov Con architecture and its limitations. This information will then be examined through the contrary view of the CAF not requiring strategic Mov Con, which will lead to a recommended solution.

DISCUSSION

4. NATO defines the movement processes as comprised of three distinct legs, a national leg connecting the home base to the Point of Embarkation (POE), a strategic leg connecting the POE to the Point of Disembarkation (POD), and an operational leg connecting the POD to the Final Destination (FD).² By this definition, it is clear to see that any overseas deployment by the CAF involves a strategic leg or strategic movement, however, given the size of Canada and the dispersed nature of the CAF, many domestic movements involve strategic movement as well.

5. Core activities such as recurring exercise require large and complex legs of strategic movement. A routine example of this is the movement of personnel and equipment from Canadian Forces Base (CFB) Petawawa to CFB Wainwright. Additionally, routine

¹ John Keegan, *Supreme Command: Soldiers, Statesmen, and Leadership in Wartime* (New York: Random House, 2002), accessed February 26, 2023, <https://www.nytimes.com/2002/07/21/books/chapters/supreme-command.html>.

² AJP-4.4 Allied Joint Movement and Transport Doctrine (Edition C)," accessed February 26 2023, 1-4, https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/1106360/20220908-AJP-4.4_Movement_EDC_V1-O_accessible.pdf.

administrative tasks such as the movement of vehicle fleets from base to base also require strategic movement as a direct result of Canada's size.

6. NATO identifies Mov Con, also known as Movements Staff, as an organization responsible to manage and oversee movement, serving as a coordinating body and interface between all parties involved in the transportation process.³ In short, the core mandate of a Mov Con organization is as follows;

- a. Plan, coordinate, and control movement; and
- b. Acts as a single point of contact for all users to communicate their transportation requirements.⁴

7. In addition, Mov Con organizations or staff provide advice to commanders, on matters relating to the movement of troops, recommending routes for implementing movement orders, acting as a liaison between units and transportation agencies, assigning traffic by route, volume, and destination, and ensuring that existing loading and unloading facilities are suitable.⁵

8. Canada's allies execute strategic Mov Con in varying ways. The United States (U.S.) Department of Defense (DoD) is a natural comparison to the CAF and it executes a robust strategic Mov Con. However, by virtue of its size and the scale of its forces, it needs to employ Mov Con to a greater extent than the CAF. That being said, these two militaries share many of the same factors when examining the fundamental need for strategic Mov Con to be implemented, with only a variance in the scale of execution. Key common factors common among these countries are the large size of both countries as well as the distance of both countries from most operations theaters.

9. The U.S. DoD meet their requirement for strategic Mov Con through The United States Transportation Command known as USTRANSOM. USTRANSCOM is a unified combatant command of the U.S. DoD responsible for coordinating and directing global transportation for the DoD including the Army, Navy, Air Force, Marine Corps, and Coast Guard. Its primary mission is to provide strategic transportation support to the military, including the movement of troops, equipment, and supplies around the world. This includes air, sea, and land transportation as well as the coordination of commercial transportation services when needed.⁶

10. One of the key roles of USTRANSCOM is to manage the Defense Transportation System, which is a global network of military and commercial transportation assets. USTRANSCOM provides Mov Con through this system as well as many other transportation

³ Definitions of Logistics and Selected Military Terms," NATO Logistics Handbook, last modified 1997, accessed February 26, 2023, <https://www.nato.int/docu/logi-en/1997/defini.htm>

⁴ Department of National Defence, B-GJ-025-401/FP-001, *Canadian Forces Joint Publication 4-1 Movement*, (Ottawa: DND Canada 2016), 3, 11.

⁵ *Ibidia*

⁶ Peters, Heidi M. "United States Transportation Command (USTRANSCOM): Overview and Selected Issues." Congressional Research Service. February 5, 2021. <https://crsreports.congress.gov/product/pdf/IF/IF11479>

services globally to the DoD.⁷ Beyond Mov Con, this system includes infrastructure such as ports, airfields, railroads, and highways as well as a fleet of military cargo aircraft and ships. USTRANSCOM works with other government agencies to ensure that transportation resources are available when and where they are needed by DoD.⁸

11. The U.S. DoD clearly executes robust Mov Con through its employment of USTRANSCOM over its strategic movement, however, they are not the only organization to recognize the necessity of strategic Mov Con. NATO also has a strategic level Mov Con function.

12. The NATO Allied Movement Coordination Centre (AMCC) is responsible for coordinating and facilitating the movement of troops, equipment, and supplies for NATO operations, exercises, and other activities on behalf of Supreme Allied Commander Europe (SACEUR), which, and is located within Supreme Headquarters Allied Powers, Europe (SHAPE), a strategic level headquarters (HQ). It acts as a central hub for the coordination of all NATO land, air, and sea transportation, ensuring that resources are efficiently and effectively allocated to support NATO's mission.⁹

13. Some of the key AMCC's responsibilities include:

- a. Coordinating the movement of NATO forces, equipment, and supplies by land, sea, and air;
- b. Providing transportation planning and logistics support to NATO operations, exercises, and other activities; and
- c. Providing information and advice to NATO commanders and member states on transportation and logistics matters.¹⁰

14. NATO provides an example of the potential framework for strategic Mov Con, however, it, along with the U.S. DoD, are far from the only allied entity to execute this capability. While not all countries within Europe individually execute strategic Mov Con, there is a strategic movement coordination center for the region as a whole. The Movement Coordination Centre Europe (MCCE) is an international military organization that provides coordination and support for the movement of military personnel and equipment across Europe and beyond.¹¹

15. The MCCE's roles and responsibilities in short include;

⁷ United States Transportation Command, accessed February 23, 2023, <https://www.ustranscom.mil/>.

⁸ *Ibidia*

⁹ AJP-4.4 Allied Joint Movement..., 2-5.

¹⁰ *Ibidia*

¹¹ Military Coordination Centre Europe (MCCE). "MCCE At-A-Glance." February 2020. <https://www.mcce-mil.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/02/MCCE-At-A-Glance.pdf>

- a. Coordinating the transportation of military personnel and equipment. The MCCE provides a single point of contact for military transportation requests, ensuring the efficient and timely movement of personnel and equipment;
- b. Providing logistics support to member nations, including transportation planning, customs clearance, as well as the storage and handling of military equipment;
- c. Supporting multinational operations by coordinating the movement of military personnel and equipment from multiple nations.¹²

16. It is clear that Canada routinely executes strategic movement both in and outside of Canada based on NATO's definition. Additionally, the need to establish a strategic Mov Con within the CAF is well supported through the demonstration of similar functions within allied partners. Not only is this established within our allies, but it is also fundamentally in line with CAF doctrine, namely the principles of Logistics.

17. The Canadian Forces Joint Publication 4.0 (CFJP 4.0) is a comprehensive manual that outlines the principles and processes of Canadian military logistics operations at the joint level. The principles of support outlined in this publication provide a framework for the effective planning, coordination, and execution of logistics operations. The document identifies nine principles of support. For brevity, the most immediately relevant principles to strategic Mov Con are discussed below, however, strategic Mov Con could improve the execution of all nine principles of support within the CAF.

18. The first principle of support in CFJP4.0 is Foresight. Foresight is a crucial ability in support planning and execution as it enables both support commanders and planners to predict and manage constraints that may impact the force commander's freedom of action. This involves assessing future operations and forecasting future support requirements. Foresight is not just about anticipating future operations but it also involves identifying, accumulating, and maintaining support assets, capabilities, and information to ensure preparedness.¹³ Strategic Mov Con will greatly enable foresight as it will provide relevant a Common Operating Picture (COP) of movement along all SLOCs which can enable support as well as provide a single point of contact for a wealth of information that can assist in ensuring preparedness.

19. The second principle is Economy. Economy, or economy of effort as it is more commonly referred to, involves minimizing the use of resources in areas other than the main effort to ensure mission success is not jeopardized. With support resources, such as strategic movement capabilities, which are usually in short supply, commanders must consider this when allocating resources. CFJP4.0 states that centralized control of resources can be efficient, but should be balanced with the operational plan's requirements.¹⁴ This centralization of resources will be enabled through the COP and centralized Mov Con that a strategic Mov Con capability would provide.

¹²Movement Coordination Centre Europe, accessed February 23, 2023, <https://mcce-mil.org/>.

¹³ Department of National Defence, B-GJ-005-400/FP-001, *Canadian Forces Joint Publication 4-0 Support*, (Ottawa: DND Canada 2014), 1, 3.

¹⁴ *Ibidia*

20. The third principle is Flexibility. Flexibility, in terms of logistics, refers to the ability to adapt structures, functions, and procedures to changing situations. Flexibility can be achieved through planning for the establishment of reserve stocks of critical materiel and through the effective use of different types of support resources such as contracting, host-nation support (HNS), or the use of national or international governments and civilian organizations. This principle highlights the need for logistics operations to be integrated across all levels of the CAF, as well as with other government agencies and allies. Effective integration requires the sharing of information and resources to improve efficiency and effectiveness.¹⁵ The functions of strategic Mov Con support this requirement as it will highlight opportunities for exploitation and provide options within limited resources as well as enable Command and Control (C2) along the SLOCs.

21. The fourth principle is Simplicity. Simplicity seeks to ensure that support arrangements are easily understood and robust. Simplicity is crucial in both their concept and execution. When support processes and procedures are simple, flexibility is enhanced.¹⁶ Strategic Mov Con enhances simplicity by providing a single node for all information for strategic movement.

22. The seventh principle of logistics and the final one to be examined in this service paper is visibility. Commanders must have visibility of force assets, inbound material, and priorities to effectively control, allocate, or coordinate support. Visibility is achieved through timely and relevant information, which enhances situational awareness.¹⁷ Strategic Mov Con again will enhance this through the COP it would provide along all SLOCs.

23. The execution of strategic Mov Con supports each of the principles of logistics through its ability to manage and oversee movement. It serves as a coordinating body and an interface between all parties involved in the transportation process, building a COP of the SLOCs while fulfilling its roles. However, if the concept of strategic Mov Con is already well supported by allies and most importantly, is also in line with Canadian doctrine, then why does the CAF not already have this capability? While the CAF does not have a single point of strategic Mov Con, it does have multiple operational-level coordination elements that look to fulfill certain elements of this task with the most robust elements embedded within the Canadian Joint Operations Command (CJOC).

24. CJOC is responsible for overseeing specific CAF operations and exercises, excluding those managed by North American Aerospace Defense Command or CANSOFCOM.¹⁸ Within CJOC is the J4 Movements (J4 Mov) section, which is the closest the CAF has to a strategic Mov Con capability, however, this capability is located at the operational level and not the strategic level. J4 Mov provides coordination of operational movement support is managed by the J4 Mov staff, with assistance from the Canadian Forces Joint Operational Support Group (CFJOSG) and the Canadian Materiel Support Group (CMSG).¹⁹

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 1,4.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁸ Canadian Joint Operations Command, Department of National Defence, accessed February 23, 2023, <https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/corporate/organizational-structure/canadian-joint-operations-command.html>.

¹⁹ Joint Publication 4.1 Movements...3,1.

25. Canadian doctrine CFJP 4.1 Movement identifies the J4 Mov section's role as responsible for planning, coordinating, monitoring, and controlling strategic movement operations. It executes this thorough working with various departments and partners such as the Strategic Joint Staff (SJS), Royal Canadian Navy (RCN), Canadian Army (CA), Royal Canadian Air Force (RCAF), Canadian Special Operations Command (CANSOFCOM), and international partners. Their responsibilities in short include:

- a. Planning movement support for all stages of CAF operations;
- b. Participating in strategic and operational level movement reconnaissance;
- c. Identifying transportation requirements and coordinating additional resources, including contracting transportation assets from the commercial industry if necessary;
- d. Preparing and issuing movement annexes to operational-level orders;
- e. Coordinating, controlling, and monitoring the execution of strategic deployment, sustainment, and redeployment, including reconciling competing priorities;
- f. Contributing to the development of national policy, training, and doctrine; and
- g. Providing national-level movement and transportation advice to the SJS in developing strategic concepts and plans.²⁰

26. CJOC J4 Mov currently holds many of the key functions that would be required by a strategic level Mov Con, thus an argument could be made that given CJOC J4 Mov's role, combined with the CAF's relatively small size, a truly strategic level Mov Con function is not required. While this conclusion may seem sound at first glance, it overlooks some critical factors when examining strategic movement within Canada as well as overlooking some shortfalls of the capabilities of CJOC J4 Mov capabilities simply as a result of the section's placement at the operational level within the CJOC HQ.

27. Firstly, as has been established previously, the CAF conducts strategic movement routinely outside of the scope of operational support. This ranges from simple force generation activities required at the base and wing level to more complex movements for military exercises. These strategic level movement activities go largely unsynchronized with J4 Mov as the section simply does not have oversight on them. J4 Mov focuses on strategic movement that is a requirement within the realm of operational support, thus creating missed opportunities for efficiencies with strategic movement that occurs outside of the realm of operational support. A truly strategic level Mov Con capability would be able to identify and exploit these opportunities as it would have visibility of SLOCs across level ones (L1s).

²⁰ *Ibidia*

28. Secondly J4 Mov does not provide all the functions associated with a strategic Mov Con. A key aspect that is missing is the Mov Con authority for SLOCs outside of CJOC commanded operations. J4 Mov, as a function of its authority within the CJOC HQ, can control the SLOC of operations under CJOC's command, however, J4 Mov has no authority for Mov Con for SLOCs occurring outside of CJOC operations. Thus, regardless of if J4 Mov has visibility on the movement, it has no authority to execute Mov Con over these SLOCs occurring outside of CJOC operations. This lack of central Mov Con authority over SLOCs leads to inefficiencies and conflicting prioritization along SLOCs of limited transport resources.

CONCLUSION

29. There are multiple examples of strategic Mov Con being executed within our allies and other military organizations. Based on this and the tasks of strategic Mov Con being closely aligned with the CAF principles of logistics, it is clear that establishing a Mov Con function at the strategic level can serve as a critical enabler to military logistics as a whole. Despite the CAF's best efforts to mitigate its lack of strategic Mov Con with the employment of CJOC J4 Mov, there are still many opportunities left unexploited that would result in better utilization of the CAF's limited strategic movement capabilities if a strategic Mov Con was implemented.

RECOMMENDATION

30. The CAF should create a Mov Con capability located at the strategic level to execute Mov Con over all SLOCs for all modes of transportation to provide efficient and effective use of the CAF's limited transportation resources.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Canada, Department of National Defence, B-GJ-005-400/FP-001, *Canadian Forces Joint Publication 4-0 Support*, Ottawa: DND Canada 2014.
- Canada, Department of National Defence, B-GJ-025-401/FP-001, *Canadian Forces Joint Publication 4-1 Movement*, Ottawa: DND Canada 2016.
- Canada, "Canadian Joint Operations Command, Department of National Defence," accessed February 23, 2023, <https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/corporate/organizational-structure/canadian-joint-operations-command.html>.
- John Keegan, "Supreme Command: Soldiers, Statesmen, and Leadership in Wartime (New York: Random House, 2002)", accessed February 26, 2023, <https://www.nytimes.com/2002/07/21/books/chapters/supreme-command.html>.
- Military Coordination Centre Europe (MCCE). "MCCE At-A-Glance." February 2020. <https://www.mcce-mil.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/02/MCCE-At-A-Glance.pdf>
- Movement Coordination Centre Europe, "Movement Coordination Centre Europe," accessed February 23, 2023, <https://mcce-mil.org/>.
- NATO, "AJP-4.4 Allied Joint Movement and Transport Doctrine (Edition C)," accessed February 26 2023, https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/1106360/20220908-AJP-4.4_Movement_EDC_V1-O_accessible.pdf.
- NATO, "Definitions of Logistics and Selected Military Terms, NATO Logistics Handbook, last modified 1997," accessed February 26, 2023, <https://www.nato.int/docu/logi-en/1997/defini.htm>
- Peters, Heidi M. "United States Transportation Command (USTRANSCOM): Overview and Selected Issues." Congressional Research Service. February 5, 2021. <https://crsreports.congress.gov/product/pdf/IF/IF11479>
- United States, "United States Transportation Command," accessed February 23, 2023, <https://www.ustranscom.mil/>.