

Canadian
Forces
College

Collège
des
Forces
Canadiennes



CLOSING THE GAPS IN GENDER INTEGRATION

Major Caroline Rivard

JCSP 48

Service Paper

Disclaimer

Opinions expressed remain those of the author and do not represent Department of National Defence or Canadian Forces policy. This paper may not be used without written permission.

© Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada, as represented by the Minister of National Defence, 2022

PCEMI 48

Étude militaire

Avertissement

Les opinions exprimées n'engagent que leurs auteurs et ne reflètent aucunement des politiques du Ministère de la Défense nationale ou des Forces canadiennes. Ce papier ne peut être reproduit sans autorisation écrite.

© Sa Majesté la Reine du Chef du Canada, représentée par le ministre de la Défense nationale, 2022

CANADIAN FORCES COLLEGE – COLLÈGE DES FORCES CANADIENNES

JCSP 48 – PCEMI 48
2021 – 2022

Service Paper – Étude militaire

CLOSING THE GAPS IN GENDER INTEGRATION

Major Caroline Rivard

“This paper was written by a student attending the Canadian Forces College in fulfilment of one of the requirements of the Course of Studies. The paper is a scholastic document, and thus contains facts and opinions, which the author alone considered appropriate and correct for the subject. It does not necessarily reflect the policy or the opinion of any agency, including the Government of Canada and the Canadian Department of National Defence. This paper may not be released, quoted or copied, except with the express permission of the Canadian Department of National Defence.”

“La présente étude a été rédigée par un stagiaire du Collège des Forces canadiennes pour satisfaire à l'une des exigences du cours. L'étude est un document qui se rapporte au cours et contient donc des faits et des opinions que seul l'auteur considère appropriés et convenables au sujet. Elle ne reflète pas nécessairement la politique ou l'opinion d'un organisme quelconque, y compris le gouvernement du Canada et le ministère de la Défense nationale du Canada. Il est défendu de diffuser, de citer ou de reproduire cette étude sans la permission expresse du ministère de la Défense nationale.”

CLOSING THE GAPS IN GENDER INTEGRATION

AIM

1. This service paper aims to provide senior Canadian Armed Forces (CAF) leadership with an analysis of the state of the integration of gender perspectives in the CAF with a view to improve operational effectiveness. The author will define key concepts related to gender perspectives to adequately frame the issue and analyze current successes and gaps in the integration of gender perspectives. The author will conclude with recommendations to assist commanders in closing the remaining gaps in gender perspectives integration to assist commanders in achieving the best operational effects.

INTRODUCTION

2. The adoption of the United Nations Security Council Resolution (UNSCR) 1325 in October 2000 and follow-on resolutions marked an important landmark in the development of a deliberate agenda on women, peace and security.¹ The resolution restated the way conflicts affect women and several other vulnerable groups in different ways. It also reaffirmed the call for action on member states to articulate a plan and concrete actions to integrate gender perspective at all levels. Additionally, the resolution reiterated the importance of integrating women at all levels in the peace process.

3. Following the promulgation of UNSCR 1325 and follow-on resolutions, the CAF published its own directive in January 2016 with the intent of fully integrating UNSCR 1325 and its resolutions in CAF Planning and Operations. The women, peace and security initiative was articulated around four pillars:

- a. Prevention seeks to identify the “differential experiences of men and women, boys and girls in conflict situations”² and relevant strategies to prevent violence, including sexual violence directed at women and girls;³
- b. Participation calls for “meaningful participation and representation of women and local women’s groups in peace and security activities;”⁴
- c. Protection refers to the requirement to protect vulnerable populations from violence including Sexual and Gender Based Violence (SGBV);⁵ and

¹ United Nations General Assembly, *United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325* (New-York: UN, 2000).

² Department of National Defence, “CDS Directive for Integrating UNSCR 1325 and Related Resolutions into CAF Planning and Operations,” last accessed 20 January 2022, <https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/services/operations/military-operations/conduct/cds-directive-unscr-1325.html>

³ *Ibid.*

⁴ *Ibid.*

⁵ *Ibid.*

- d. Finally, the last pillar, relief and recovery speaks to “promoting and working to ensure women’s equal access to humanitarian and development assistance.”⁶

4. Since then, several initiatives have flourished to fully integrate the ambitious plan outlined in the Chief of the Defence Staff (CDS) directive. It is now time to take stock and evaluate the successes and remaining challenges in gender perspective integration to bolster operational effectiveness.

5. The analysis will proceed in the following fashion: first, the author will define key concepts including gender balancing and gender mainstreaming to adequately frame the issue of gender perspectives. Second, current successes of the integration of gender perspectives in operations will be explored in three different domains: governance and doctrine, training and education, as well as actual integration in operations. Thirdly, remaining gaps in all three domains will be presented. Finally, a way forward and recommendations will be provided to enable successful gender perspectives integration to support success in operations.

DISCUSSION

6. In order to properly situate what is meant by “gender perspective”, the concepts of gender balancing and gender mainstreaming will be defined to properly frame the discussion.

Gender balancing: definition and implications

7. The Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) defines gender balancing as: “the degree to which men and women hold the full range of positions in a society or organization.”⁷ This concept ties to gender equity, that is: “the fair treatment of women and men.”⁸ Measures to ensure adequate representation of women at different levels and within a range of organizations are often needed to support gender equity which in turn, promotes gender equality which is defined as “equality under the law, equality of opportunity, and equality of voice...”⁹

8. The implications of gender balancing center on the “numbers game” that is often expressed by organizational quotas of representation of women in certain spheres. We can think about the CAF goal of achieving 25% representation of women by 2027 as a gender balancing objective.¹⁰ The implications also indicate that gender balancing may

⁶ *Ibid.*

⁷ Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, *OECD, Gender Balance Guide Actions for UAE Organisation* (OECD Publishing; Paris, September 2017), 13.

⁸ *Ibid.*

⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁰ Department of National Defence, *Strong, Secure, Engaged: Canada’s Defence Policy* (Ottawa: Canada Communications Group, 2017, 23.

not be sufficient to fully achieve gender equality. Another implication for operations is that gender balancing, namely adding women to operations and expect success may be insufficient.

Gender mainstreaming: definition and implications

9. By contrast, the United Women organization, a Branch of the UN “dedicated to gender equality and the empowerment of women,”¹¹ defines gender mainstreaming goals as: “ensuring that gender perspectives and attention to the goal of gender equality are central to all activities...”¹²

10. The implication is that the ultimate goal of gender mainstreaming is gender equality. This means changing the mission culture and operational mindset and getting away from a male hegemonic idea of cultural assumptions, ideas and mindset in a given theatre of operation.

11. The next section will address successes in governance, doctrine, training and education. It will also outline successful integration of gender perspectives in operations.

Current successes in governance and doctrine

12. Since the CDS’s promulgation of the directive on for Integrating UNSCR 1325 and Related Resolutions into CAF Planning and Operations, the Gender Based Analysis+ (GBA+) has been the prominent tool to incorporate gender perspectives into governmental policies and initiatives. It is also being used in planning for operations. GBA+ incorporates a step-by-step process to assess the impact of a policy or initiatives on women and other vulnerable groups.¹³ The tool, initially used gender as an entry point for analysis and has since been broadened to include the “+”, signifying incorporating intersectional factors such as ethnicity, disability, age, income.¹⁴

13. The promulgation of UNSCR also saw the creation of Gender Advisors (GENADs). The GENADs “serve as specialist advisors for the Commanders [and are] responsible for the overall integration of gender perspectives into military planning, execution and evaluation.”¹⁵ The CDS directive mandated that GBA+ be fully incorporated as part of the Operational Planning Process (OPP) as well as “[t]he embedding of the requirements of UNSCR 1325 and related resolutions into the CAF approach to command and control, leadership, and management...”¹⁶

¹¹ United Women, “Gender Mainstreaming”, accessed 16 January 2022, <https://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/gendermainstreaming.htm>

¹² *Ibid.*

¹³ Department of National Defence, “Thinking about gender in military planning and operations”, last accessed 19 January 2022, <https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/services/operations/military-operations/conduct/gender-perspectives.html>

¹⁴ *Ibid.*

¹⁵ *Ibid.*

¹⁶ *Ibid.*

14. Arguably, never before has the CAF seen more commitment in terms of governance and explicitly stated goals related to the women, peace and security agenda. These initiatives give us a strong starting point for change.

Current successes in training and education

15. The CDS directive also stated that training on GBA+ would be mandatory within the military. Since then, the GBA+ online course has been systematically implemented in the military and integrated within military course curriculums. In terms of Force Generation, GBA+ has also been implemented as part of pre-deployment training. Additional training has also been targeted for GENAD or other advisors in order to support commanders in implementing GBA+¹⁷.

Successes in operations

16. There are a number of accounts in literature of the success of integrating women in operations. Bridges and Horsfall, in their article on operational effectiveness in UN Peacekeeping missions, note a number of peacekeeping operations case studies where gender perspectives were successfully implemented. The case studies show that local women confide more in other women, female negotiators are more apt at understanding and articulating the peace process to other women better than their male counterpart.¹⁸ The presence of female has a reassuring effects on local populations, particularly and reinforces the credibility of the force.¹⁹ In a very practical sense, women can search other women, ease tension at checkpoints and can have better access in matrilineal communities.²⁰ The added benefits of balanced representation of women in operations is noted in countless accounts, whether as a benefit to the technical conduct of operations (searches, checkpoints) or to empower local women in the areas in which female peacekeepers operate.

Remaining gaps in governance and doctrine

17. The next section will identify remaining gaps in the governance, doctrine, training, education and obstacles to success in gender mainstreaming in operations.

18. In their study of gender in military operations von Hlatky and Lacoursière from Queen's University, discussed the results of a panel of Women, Peace and Security practitioners and experts. The experts pointed to GBA+ as a faulty tool, ill-suited for

¹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁸ Donna Bridges and Debbie Horsfall. "Increasing Operational Effectiveness in UN Peacekeeping: Toward a Gender-Balanced Force," *Armed Forces & Society* 36, no. 1 (October 2009): 125, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0095327X08327818>.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 126.

²⁰ *Ibid.*

defence policies and military operations.²¹ GBA+ may be a useful tool to apply to governmental policies but the terminology may not resonate as much with a military audience. Doctrinally and despite a very clear intent of the CDS to fully implement GBA+ in the OPP, there is not clear evidence in Joint Doctrine that this process is fully superimposed in the current OPP steps.²² It is largely assumed, that a commander will enact the steps of this process in a deliberate manner and consider gender perspectives and other intersectional issues (ethnicity, disability, income, etc.) as a factor in mission analysis.

Remaining gaps in training and education

19. The original GBA course has not been adapted to the various CAF audiences and for the most part, has been relegated to an online course with limited interaction. von Hlatky and Lacoursière indicate that "...gender education and training needs to better reflect the entire career cycle, from basic training to the CFC's senior officer's professional military education system."²³ On JCSP, for example, the current curriculum covers aspects of the women, peace and in the form of a human security activity consisting of a podcast with associated readings²⁴ as well as a case study.²⁵ CFC also offers a Gender Perspective in Defence and Security complimentary elective course but it is not part of the core curriculum. While this promotes more in-depth learning, this does not guarantee a systematic implementation in the actual OPP after the course. In other words, this may not result in the intended behavioral changes for future planners and commanders.

Remaining gaps in application in operations

20. Bridges and Horsfall point out that in UN missions "out of the twenty-six missions in 2005, two females were serving as the heads of missions and one as a deputy."²⁶ Hurley indicate that in NATO, the " 'A' grade of managerial and professional positions 68.9 per cent were men compared to 31.1 per cent women..."²⁷. This is indicative of poor women representation at the managerial and senior leadership levels in UN and NATO. Additionally, when examining the role of GENADs in advising

²¹ Stéfanie von Hlatky and Andréanne Lacoursière, "Why Gender Matters in the Military and for its Operations," *Centre for International and Defence Policy Special Policy Report*, (Queen's University, March 2019): 3.

²² Department of National Defence, B-GJ-005-500/FP-000, *CFJP 5.0 The Canadian Forces Operational Planning Process, Change 2* (Ottawa: DND Canada, 2008).

²³ *Ibid.*

²⁴ Canadian Forces College. "Planning Considerations – Human security" (Joint Command and Staff Program Course 48 Activity Package DS520/OPC/LE-4).

²⁵ Canadian Forces College. "Human Security/Gender Perspective Case Study" (Joint Command and Staff Program Course 48 Activity Package DS520/OPC/CS-1).

²⁶ Donna Bridges, and Debbie Horsfall, "Increasing Operational Effectiveness in UN Peacekeeping: Toward a Gender-Balanced Force." ..., 121.

²⁷ Matthew Hurley, "Gender Mainstreaming and Integration in the North Atlantic Treaty Organisation," in *The Palgrave International Handbook of Gender and the* (UK: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017), 406.

commanders, von Hlatky and Lacoursière indicate that the weight and influence of GENADs depends on whether or not they have a seat at the table. Commanders may choose to ignore their advice or take it fully in stride.²⁸

21. Another disturbing trend outlined by Bridges and Horsfall that is viewed as a “positive” contribution of women in Peace Support Operations is noting that “...females can also set an example for their male colleagues about the inappropriateness of sexually exploiting women in host nations.”²⁹ Not only women in operations have the added burden of being adequate representatives of their gender and display what has been ascribed to them as desirable “female” traits, they also have to police their own peers in avoiding inappropriate behavior and sexual exploitation of women in the host nation.

22. The qualities, traits and attitudes displayed by women that make operations successful should be trained, developed and coached in both men and women early on in their career.

The way forward

23. The above discussion illustrates a number of successes in the women, peace and security agenda, most notably, in implementing training efforts across the military and in pre-deployment training and in the pursuit of employment equity goals as a departmental priority. The GBA+ was developed and implemented. Follow-on directives by the CDS mandated the use of GBA+ as an integral part of OPP.

24. While these efforts were necessary to actively promote gender perspectives integration, it is clearly insufficient in terms of behavioral changes that must result after training and the expected level of operational effectiveness.

25. Strategies to ensure commanders not only “consider” gender perspective but fully integrate them will require a multitude of interventions in the training domain, in doctrine and in application in operations planning. Training must be adapted to Defence and the military specifically. It must be meaningful and yield the intended behavioral changes not only at junior levels but at the senior levels of leadership. The results of training must lead to the systematic consideration of gender perspectives in mission analysis. While gender is the entry point of the analysis, it is not the only one as other intersectional factors must be considered in mission planning. Further, the traits, attitudes and qualities that women display on operations that directly contributes to mission success must be developed through training and coaching for men and women. In fact, some men may be more “gender aware” than their women counterparts. It cannot be assumed that GENADs tasks must be relegated to women as an added burden.

26. The GBA+ process must be adapted for military practitioners. This tool has a

²⁸ Stéfanie von Hlatky and Andréanne Lacoursière, “Why Gender Matters in the Military and for its Operations” ..., 7

²⁹ Donna Bridges and Debbie Horsfall, “Increasing Operational Effectiveness in UN Peacekeeping: Toward a Gender-Balanced Force.” ..., 122.

better chance of being implemented in the planning process and adopted by commanders if it can be relatable to military operations. Doctrinally, the GBA+ process must be ‘baked into’ the planning process.

27. Gender mainstreaming must be pursued. While gender balancing is a start in increasing female representation in organizations, women must be represented at all levels of the organizations for changes to occur. Crawford, Lebovic and McDonald in their article on gender composition of UN Peacekeeping Operations stated that:

When women are fully integrated into a country’s armed services, police ranks, and professional (expert)-labor force, the decision to volunteer women for global assignments and international missions would essentially become a non-decision.³⁰

CONCLUSION

28. This paper outlined several areas of success in the integrations of gender perspectives and examples of successful gender integration in operations. There are still gaps to address as the number of initiatives to promote the women, peace and security agenda and promote successful integration of gender perspective did not necessarily result in full, systematic integration of the GBA+ process in planning for operations. It also did not result in assimilating a gender mainstreaming mindset to achieve optimal operational effectiveness.

29. The way forward presented in addressing remaining gaps will require interventions in multiple domains including governance, doctrine, training, education and pursuing a gender mainstreaming approach in order for commanders to fully integrate gender perspectives for operational effectiveness.

RECOMMENDATIONS

30. In light of the discussion above, the following recommendations are presented to the senior leadership for consideration:

- a. In order to address gaps in doctrine and governance, the following is recommended:
 - (1) Tailor GBA+ for military operations to ensure that the process is relatable and can be applied to operational military planning; and
 - (2) Include GBA+ process or the consideration of gender perspectives and other intersectional factors as part of OPP doctrine. This process must be fully embedded within OPP to ensure

³⁰ Kerry Crawford, James Lebovic, and Julia Macdonald, “Explaining the Variation in Gender Composition of Personnel Contributions to UN Peacekeeping Operations,” *Armed Forces & Society* 4, no 2 (2015): 276, <https://journals-sagepub-com.cfc.idm.oclc.org/doi/10.1177/0095327X14523416>

commanders do not ignore this factor in mission analysis and Courses of Action development.

- b. In order to address gaps in training and education, the following is recommended:
 - (1) Revise gender perspectives training to promote more meaningful, deep learning. Training must include case studies, discussions and activities that leverage higher orders of thinking from application in practical contexts in operations to analysis and evaluation at the more senior ranks. Pre-deployment training on gender perspectives must not be relegated to a power point presentation given in a full day of training;
 - (2) Review GBA+ training as it must be adapted to suit a military audience; and
 - (3) Add the current Gender in Defence and Security complimentary course on JCSP as core curriculum to increase senior leadership awareness to gender perspectives.
- c. In order to address gaps in operations, the following is recommended:
 - (1) Empower GENADs and GFPs and give them a more significant role with commanders and planning staff in operations. GENADs and GFPs should not be assigned solely because of their gender but their capacity to positively influence the planning process with viable recommendations; and
 - (2) Strive for realistic gender balancing goals and adequate representation of women at all levels of the organization in order to attain gender mainstreaming goals.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Bridges, Donna, and Debbie Horsfall. "Increasing Operational Effectiveness in UN Peacekeeping: Toward a Gender-Balanced Force." *Armed Forces & Society* 36, no. 1 (October 2009): 120–130. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0095327X08327818>.

Canada. Department of National Defence, B-GJ-005-500/FP-000, *CFJP 5.0 The Canadian Forces Operational Planning Process, Change 2*. Ottawa: DND Canada, 2008.

Canadian Forces College. "Human Security/Gender Perspective Case Study." Joint Command and Staff Program Course 48 Activity Package DS520/OPC/CS-1.

Canadian Forces College. "Planning Considerations – Human security." Joint Command and Staff Program Course 48 Activity Package DS520/OPC/LE-4.

Canada, Department of National Defence. *Strong, Secure, Engaged: Canada's Defence Policy*. Ottawa: Canada Communication Group, 2017.

Crawford, Kerry, James Lebovic, and Julia Macdonald. "Explaining the Variation in Gender Composition of Personnel Contributions to UN Peacekeeping Operations." *Armed Forces & Society* 4, no 2 (2015): 257-281. <https://journals-sagepub-com.cfc.idm.oclc.org/doi/10.1177/0095327X14523416>.

Department of National Defence. "CDS Directive for Integrating UNSCR 1325 and Related Resolutions into CAF Planning and Operations." Last accessed 20 January 2022. <https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/services/operations/military-operations/conduct/cds-directive-unscr-1325.html>.

Department of National Defence, "Thinking about gender in military planning and operations." Last accessed 19 January 2022. <https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/services/operations/military-operations/conduct/gender-perspectives.html>.

Hurley, Matthew. "Gender Mainstreaming and Integration in the North Atlantic Treaty Organisation." In *The Palgrave International Handbook of Gender and the Military*, 403-418. UK: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017.

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, OECD. *Gender Balance Guide Actions for UAE Organisation*. Paris: OECD Publishing; 2017.

United Nations General Assembly, *United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325*
New-York: UN, 2000.

United Women, “Gender Mainstreaming.” Last accessed 16 January 2022,
<https://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/gendermainstreaming.htm>

von Hlatky, Stephanie and Andréanne Lacoursière. “Why Gender Matters in the Military and for its Operations.” *Centre for International and Defence Policy, Special Policy Report* . Queen’s University (March 2019): 1-9.