

Canadian
Forces
College

Collège
des
Forces
Canadiennes



OPTIMIZING THE LOCATION OF THE CANADIAN FORCES COLLEGE

Cdr M.T. Lahaie

JCSP 42

Service Paper

Disclaimer

Opinions expressed remain those of the author and do not represent Department of National Defence or Canadian Forces policy. This paper may not be used without written permission.

© Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada, as represented by the Minister of National Defence, 2016.

PCEMI 42

Étude militaire

Avertissement

Les opinions exprimées n'engagent que leurs auteurs et ne reflètent aucunement des politiques du Ministère de la Défense nationale ou des Forces canadiennes. Ce papier ne peut être reproduit sans autorisation écrite.

© Sa Majesté la Reine du Chef du Canada, représentée par le ministre de la Défense nationale, 2016.

CANADIAN FORCES COLLEGE – COLLÈGE DES FORCES CANADIENNES
JCSP 42 – PCEMI 42
2015 – 2016

JCSP SERVICE PAPER – PCEMI ÉTUDE MILITAIRE

**OPTIMIZING THE LOCATION OF THE CANADIAN FORCES
COLLEGE**

Cdr M.T. Lahaie

“This paper was written by a student attending the Canadian Forces College in fulfilment of one of the requirements of the Course of Studies. The paper is a scholastic document, and thus contains facts and opinions, which the author alone considered appropriate and correct for the subject. It does not necessarily reflect the policy or the opinion of any agency, including the Government of Canada and the Canadian Department of National Defence. This paper may not be released, quoted or copied, except with the express permission of the Canadian Department of National Defence.”

Word Count: 2350

“La présente étude a été rédigée par un stagiaire du Collège des Forces canadiennes pour satisfaire à l'une des exigences du cours. L'étude est un document qui se rapporte au cours et contient donc des faits et des opinions que seul l'auteur considère appropriés et convenables au sujet. Elle ne reflète pas nécessairement la politique ou l'opinion d'un organisme quelconque, y compris le gouvernement du Canada et le ministère de la Défense nationale du Canada. Il est défendu de diffuser, de citer ou de reproduire cette étude sans la permission expresse du ministère de la Défense nationale.”

Compte de mots: 2350

OPTIMIZING THE LOCATION OF THE CANADIAN FORCES COLLEGE

AIM

1. The aim of this service paper is to provide a recommendation for optimizing the location of the Canadian Forces College by comparing three different locations, specifically, Toronto, Ottawa and Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu. Based upon this recommendation, follow on study will be necessary in order to determine feasibility and the actual timeline required to achieve such a move.

INTRODUCTION

2. The Canadian Forces College, formerly known as the Royal Canadian Air Force War Staff College and the Canadian Forces Command and Staff College, was established in its current location in 1943.¹ The current mission of the college is to prepare “selected senior Canadian Armed Forces officers, international military, public service and private sector leaders, for joint command and staff appointments or future strategic responsibilities within a complex global security environment.”² Based upon the current and future curricula, the student body demographic and fiscal restraint, the time has come to review the location of the Canadian Forces College to determine if, from a location perspective, it is actually meeting its stated mission. Past reviews occurred prior to the consolidation of the environmental headquarters in Ottawa and the creation of the Canadian Joint Operations Command. These factors, combined with the likelihood of a new White Paper on Defence and the new infrastructure opportunities

¹Government of Canada, “About the Canadian Forces College,” last modified 17 September 2015, <http://www.cfc.forces.gc.ca/200-eng.html>.

²Government of Canada, “Mission and Vision of the Canadian Forces College,” last modified 15 May 2014, <http://www.cfc.forces.gc.ca/263-eng.html>.

potentially available at the Carling Campus, make a review of the location of CFC both relevant and timely.

3. In order to effectively compare and contrast the three possible locations, the criteria of recurring personnel costs, proximity to civilian academia, university accreditation, proximity to senior members of the Canadian Armed Forces and other government departments, transportation, availability of guest speakers and staffing will be used as criteria. In order for any of the potential options to be considered viable, there must be a resultant savings in recurring personnel costs. All other factors are considered to be desirable.

DISCUSSION

4. Canadian Armed Forces infrastructure requirements undergo periodic reviews depending upon the government of the day. The last major review of defence infrastructure occurred in 1994, with both the release of a White Paper on Defence and the 1994 federal budget. The budget stated that “for years, defence infrastructure has exceeded any probable defence need”³ and made calls for the closing and reduction of Canadian Forces Bases and units.⁴ The 1994 White Paper on Defence made calls for further reductions through the elimination of one level of headquarters and further consolidation of the Department of National Defence in Ottawa.⁵ Based upon this direction, the Canadian Forces closed several bases and reduced from three military colleges to one. A review of the location of the Canadian Forces College would have been logical at that time, but the cost required to initiate new infrastructure was unpalatable.

³Department of Finance Canada, *The Budget in Brief* (Ottawa: Distribution Centre Department of Finance, 1994), 14.

⁴*Ibid.*

⁵Department of National Defence, *1994 Defence White Paper*, (Ottawa: Canada Communications Group, 1994), 7.

Rationale Behind Sites Chosen

5. The sites chosen for this review were selected based upon what each site has to offer. The status quo option is the current location of the Canadian Forces College; this location meets all the necessary infrastructure requirements, including classrooms, large lecture halls, dining and mess facilities and accommodations. The site is presently undergoing extensive renovations to ensure that the college can continue to meet its stated mission. The college is in a well-established community and is well known in academic circles in Toronto.

6. Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu and specifically, Fort Saint-Jean, is the current home of the Royal Military College Saint-Jean (RMCSJ) and the Chief Warrant Officer Osside Profession of Arms Institute. The Royal Military College offers a Preparatory Year and First Year for university students who then transfer to Royal Military College of Canada in Kingston to complete their degree requirements.⁶ The CWO Osside Institute provides professional development for senior non-commissioned members.

7. The infrastructure available in Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu is available on a leased basis through a contract established between the Department of National Defence and the Corporation Fort Saint-Jean.⁷ For the Canadian Armed Forces, this means that the requirement to maintain infrastructure on the site is borne by the Corporation and not by the Department of National Defence, resulting in significant cuts to infrastructure costs. The site has significant accommodations available, gym facilities, classrooms, a dining hall, a mess, and a library. In addition, the site has easy access to Canadian Forces Base Saint-Jean.

⁶Government of Canada, "Royal Military College Saint-Jean," last modified 22 September 2015, <http://www.cmrsj-rmcsj.forces.gc.ca/di-b/di-b-eng.asp>.

⁷Corporation du Fort Saint-Jean, "About the Fort Saint-Jean Corporation," accessed 4 February 2015, <http://www.cfsj.qc.ca/en/the-corporation/>.

8. Unlike Toronto and Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu, the National Capital Region does not have existing infrastructure for the Canadian Forces College. Nonetheless, it is a logical site for consideration due to its proximity to both National Defence Headquarters and the Government of Canada. Establishing a joint educational establishment for senior military officer professional development in a nation's capital is not unprecedented; the National Defence University in the United States is located in Washington, D.C.⁸, and the École de Guerre in France is located in Paris.⁹

9. Historically, the National Capital Region did not possess an appropriate site for the Canadian Forces College. However, the recent purchase of the Carling Campus represents a potential unique opportunity to develop a site for CFC. The new Carling Campus will house all the necessary facilities found on any base; over and above these facilities, classrooms and accommodations would be required. The cost savings from the move of National Defence Headquarters to Carling Campus is estimated to be approximately 910 million dollars.¹⁰ A portion of these savings could be reinvested into establishing a new and revitalized location for the Canadian Forces College in the National Capital Region.

Recurring Personnel Costs

10. In a time of fiscal restraint, any discussion centered on moving a key Canadian Armed Forces institution from one location to another must achieve long term cost savings. For the

⁸National Defense University, "The History of NDU," accessed 6 February 2015, <http://www.ndu.edu/About/History.aspx>.

⁹Ministère de la Défense, "École de Guerre Informations Pratiques," accessed 6 February 2015, <http://www.dems.defense.gouv.fr/ecole-de-guerre/l-ecole/informations-pratiques/>.

¹⁰Government of Canada, "Public Works and Government Services Canada," last modified 22 September 2015, <http://www.tpsgc-pwgsc.gc.ca/biens-property/carlingcampus-eng.html>.

purposes of this service paper, recurring personnel costs will be discussed, specifically; the areas of Cost Moves and Post Living Differential (PLD) will be assessed.

11. A major factor to consider in determining the optimal location for the Canadian Forces College is the number of cost moves expended on a yearly basis to move students to and from training. In accordance with figures obtained from the Directorate of Military Careers, there are an average of 100 moves per year to and from Ottawa for students attending the Joint Command and Staff Program, accounting for approximately fifty percent of the Canadian student body. These numbers would be similar should CFC be moved to Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu. However, with a move of CFC to Ottawa, there is the potential to save upwards of 100 cost moves per year.

12. One of the areas in which major cost savings are possible is in the area of Post Living Differential. Compensation and Benefits Instruction (CBI) 205, Allowances, states that the purpose of Post Living Differential is “to reduce the adverse financial impact on military members and their families when posted to a PLDA (Post Living Differential Area) (excluding isolated posts) with a cost of living above the national average.”¹¹ In accordance with Table 205.45 to CBI 205, PLD for the Toronto area is a maximum of \$1485 and a minimum of \$506 per month. In contrast, CAF members posted to Ottawa and Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu are not entitled to PLD.¹² Based upon PLD, cost saving could be achieved by a move of CFC to either Ottawa or Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu.

Proximity to Civilian Academia

¹¹Government of Canada, “Chapter 205 – Allowances for Officers and Non-Commissioned Members,” last modified 18 February 2015, <http://www.forces.gc.ca/en/about-policies-standards-benefits/ch-205-officer-ncm-allowance-rates.page#sec-45>.

¹²*Ibid.*

13. A key factor in ensuring that the Canadian Forces College remains academically relevant is its partnerships with other Canadian universities. Guest professors are a key facet of both the JCSP and NSP curriculum; guest professors often provide differing views from those prevalent in the broader public sector. These differing views are a critical facet of any graduate level program and are highly relevant for the future leaders of the Canadian Armed Forces. Toronto, Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu and Ottawa are all located close to Canadian universities.

14. Toronto is home to the University of Toronto, York University and Ryerson University. The Canadian Forces College has a well-established relationship with the University of Toronto and several of the professors currently employed at CFC also work at the University of Toronto. CFC also makes frequent use of the faculty at the Rotman School of Business for guest lecturers.

15. Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu is located close to Montreal, the home of McGill University, Concordia and the Université de Quebec à Montreal. All three universities offer a wide range of programs.

16. Ottawa is the home of both Carleton University and the University of Ottawa. Both schools have a wide range of graduate programs. University of Ottawa offers graduate programs in Public Administration that are focused on the executive level in government. Guest lecturers from this particular program are particularly relevant for students attending NSP.

University Accreditation

17. In order to keep pace with established international staff and war colleges, the ability to grant a graduate level degree is highly desirable. In order to grant a degree, the Canadian Forces College requires university accreditation.

18. Education, including university accreditation in Canada is a provincial responsibility.¹³ At present, CFC is accredited through the Royal Military College of Canada. The Government of Ontario, through the Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities, authorizes RMCC to grant degrees.¹⁴ This accreditation would be transferrable to a new site in Ontario, but would not be transferrable should CFC be moved to Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu. A move to Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu would require the Canadian Forces College to gain accreditation through another Quebec University. The time to attain this requirement is unknown.

Proximity to Senior CAF Officers and Other Government Departments

19. In comparison with Toronto and Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu, the National Capital Region offers a unique opportunity to engage with senior Canadian Armed Forces officers and senior officials within other government departments. The proximity to National Defence Headquarters and the headquarters for all other government departments will provide students attending the college with a broader range of perspectives. A move to the National Capital Region will also facilitate greater opportunities for internships and secondments for both JCSP and NSP students. In contrast, Toronto and Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu do not have these opportunities.

Transportation

20. The Canadian Forces College receives guest lecturers from all over the world. In order to effectively receive such guests, it is necessary for the college to be located close to both an airport and train facilities.

¹³Government of Canada, "Justice Laws," last modified 29 January 2016, <http://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/const/page-4.html>.

¹⁴Government of Ontario, "Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities," last modified 16 May 2012, <https://www.tcu.gov.on.ca/eng/about/role.html>.

21. All three locations have access to an international airport and train stations. Both Toronto and Ottawa have airports and train stations in close proximity to the city centre. By contrast, Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu is somewhat dislocated from both air and train transport and therefore, not as ideal as Ottawa and Toronto.

Availability of Guest Speakers

22. Guest speakers from outside of Canadian academia are a key facet of both the JCSP and NSP curricula. Experts in the varied subjects taught at the college bring a wealth of knowledge to the student body and ensure that the students are properly prepared to assume roles of increased responsibility.

23. Toronto's diversity, as both a government and private sector destination in Canada, provides unique opportunities for guest speakers. However, high level visitors to Toronto are not often available to speak to students at the Canadian Forces College and, as such; the opportunity is not fully exploited. Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu, with its proximity to Montreal, provides similar opportunities to those available in Toronto.

24. As the Nation's capital, Ottawa receives a variety of international high level government visitors not normally found in Toronto or Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu. In reviewing fiscal year 2014/15, high ranking military officials from the United States, the United Kingdom, China, New Zealand, Finland, Japan, India and France, to name but a few, conducted official visits to the National Capital Region. In many of these cases, these high ranking officers also spoke to the Conference of Defence Associations Institute on issues affecting their militaries. If located in Ottawa, the Canadian Forces College would be able to draw upon these foreign dignitaries as guest speakers for both the JCSP and NSP.

Staffing

25. A significant challenge of the current location of the Canadian Forces College is staffing, and more specifically, military staffing. The cost of living in Toronto and its distance from most other military sites has made it unpalatable for the group of individuals normally identified as being ideally suited for such work. This issue would be further exacerbated in Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu, where the predominant language in town is French.

26. By contrast, a move to Ottawa would increase the number of individuals available for staff postings to the Canadian Forces College. Individuals identified for posting to Canadian Forces College could be identified and appropriately screened for instructional duties. In addition, shorter duration postings would be possible, leading to higher staff turnover rates, and ultimately, creating the conditions for a constant influx of new ideas. This would serve to improve the institution as a whole and the Canadian Forces College could become a posting of choice for future senior leaders of the institution.

Comparison of Options

27. Table 27.1 provides a comparison of the three possible locations. The National Capital Region is the only location that meets the criteria of long term recurring personnel cost savings. In the areas of proximity to civilian academia and transportation, all three locations deliver similar opportunities. Under the category of Accreditation, both Toronto and Ottawa would be capable of granting degrees, while Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu would be required to achieve accreditation in the Province of Quebec. Solely the National Capital Region delivers on increased staff availability and proximity to CAF senior officers and other government

departments. Finally, the National Capital Region provides unique access to guest speakers that would not normally be available in the other two locations.

Table 27.1 – Location Comparison

Criteria	Toronto	Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu	National Capital Region
Reduced Recurring Personnel Costs			✓
Proximity to Civilian Academia	✓	✓	✓
University Accreditation	✓		✓
Proximity to Senior CAF Officers and Other Government Departments			✓
Transportation	✓	✓	✓
Increased Opportunity for Guest Speakers			✓
Increased Staffing Options			✓

CONCLUSION

28. This paper undertook a review of three potential sites to determine the most optimal location for the Canadian Forces College. Based upon the critical criteria of cost savings and the remaining desired criteria, the National Capital Region is deemed the optimal location for the Canadian Forces College.

RECOMMENDATION

29. It is recommended that a review of the infrastructure available at Carling Campus be undertaken to determine any additional investment required. Based upon this review, costing should then be conducted to determine if a move of the Canadian Forces College to Ottawa is feasible at the present juncture.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Corporation du Fort Saint-Jean. "About the Fort Saint-Jean Corporation." Accessed 4 February 2016. <http://www.cfsj.qc.ca/en/the-corporation/>.
- Department of Finance Canada. *The Budget in Brief*. Ottawa: Distribution Center Department of Finance, 1994.
- Department of National Defence. *1994 Defence White Paper*. Ottawa: Canada Communications Group, 1994.
- Government of Canada. "About the Canadian Forces College." Last modified 17 September 2015. <http://www.cfc.forces.gc.ca/200-eng.html>.
- . "Chapter 205 - Allowances for Officers and Non-Commissioned Members." Last modified 18 February 2015. <http://www.forces.gc.ca/en/about-policies-standards-benefits/ch-205-officer-ncm-allowance-rates.page#sec-45>.
- . "Justice Laws." Last modified 29 January 2016. <http://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/const/page-4.html>.
- . "Mission and Vision of the Canadian Forces College." Last modified 15 May 2014. <http://www.cfc.forces.gc.ca/263-eng.html>.
- . "Public Works and Government Services Canada." Last modified 22 September 2015. <http://www.tpsgc-pwgsc.gc.ca/biens-property/carlingcampus-eng.html>.
- . "Royal Military College Saint-Jean." Last modified 22 September 2015. <http://www.cmrsj-rmcsj.forces.gc.ca/di-b/di-b-eng.asp>.
- Government of Ontario. "Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities." Last modified 16 May 2012. <https://www.tcu.gov.on.ca/eng/about/role.html>.
- Ministere de la Defense. "Ecole de Guerre Informations Pratiques." Accessed 6 February 2016. <http://www.dems.defense.gouv.fr/ecole-de-guerre/l-ecole/informations-pratiques/>.
- National Defense University. "The History of NDU." Accessed 6 February 2016. <http://www.ndu.edu/About/History.aspx>.