# **Archived Content**

Information identified as archived on the Web is for reference, research or record-keeping purposes. It has not been altered or updated after the date of archiving. Web pages that are archived on the Web are not subject to the Government of Canada Web Standards.

As per the <u>Communications Policy of the Government of Canada</u>, you can request alternate formats on the "<u>Contact Us</u>" page.

### Information archivée dans le Web

Information archivée dans le Web à des fins de consultation, de recherche ou de tenue de documents. Cette dernière n'a aucunement été modifiée ni mise à jour depuis sa date de mise en archive. Les pages archivées dans le Web ne sont pas assujetties aux normes qui s'appliquent aux sites Web du gouvernement du Canada.

Conformément à la <u>Politique de communication du gouvernement du Canada</u>, vous pouvez demander de recevoir cette information dans tout autre format de rechange à la page « <u>Contactez-nous</u> ».

# CA NADIAN FORCES COLLEGE / COLLÈGE DES FORCES CANADIENNES

CSC 30 / CCEM 30

#### **EXERCISE NEW HORIZONS**

"MENTORING: A FORCE MULTIPLIER"

By /par Major B.W.G. McPherson Syndicate 3/Groupe d'études 3

This paper was written by a student attending the Canadian Forces College in fulfilment of one of the requirements of the Course of Studies. The paper is a scholastic document, and thus contains facts and opinions, which the author alone considered appropriate and correct for the subject. It does not necessarily reflect the policy or the opinion of any agency, including the Government of Canada and the Canadian Department of National Defence. This paper may not be released, quoted or copied except with the express permission of the Canadian Department of National Defence.

La présente étude a été rédigée par un stagiaire du Collège des Forces canadiennes pour satisfaire à l'une des exigences du cours. L'étude est un document qui se rapporte au cours et contient donc des faits et des opinions que seul l'auteur considère appropriés et convenables au sujet. Elle ne reflète pas nécessairement la politique ou l'opinion d'un organisme quelconque, y compris le gouvernement du Canada et le ministère de la Défense nationale du Canada. Il est défendu de diffuser, de citer ou de reproduire cette étude sans la permission expresse du ministère de la Défense nationale.

# **ABSTRACT**

The Canadian Forces has done much to meet the challenges posed by the new security environment; however, these advances have done little to address the challenges facing the Army. To overcome these challenges a fresh approach to individual professional development is needed and a concept that has proven to be extremely successful in many corporate and military settings is mentoring. This essay will examine the concept of mentoring and argue that mentoring would be a valuable addition to the Army's Individual Professional Development system, as it would enhance individual development while addressing the serious challenges facing the Army.

As the 21<sup>st</sup> century begins to unfold, Canada's Army finds itself in an international environment marked by considerable uncertainty. The old and familiar rules are fast disappearing, while new ones are emerging and unfolding at a speed and pace that often exceeds the ability of decision-makers to react effectively. Army leaders need to consider many more factors that are well beyond the realm of qualities and attributes traditionally assigned. The implication of this, as stated by Vice-Admiral Stansfield Turner, past President of the U.S. Naval War College is clear, "the problems we are facing are increasingly complex. More is demanded of us as officers than ever before."

A former United States Marine Corp Commandant, General Charles Krulak, posits that future war, will not be the son of Desert Storm, rather "it will be the stepchild" of Somalia, Chechnya and Operation Enduring Freedom.<sup>3</sup> It is in this environment of the "three block war" where leaders will be expected to coordinate and provide humanitarian assistance in part of the city, conduct peacekeeping operations in another and fight a lethal mid-intensity battle in a third part of the city.<sup>4</sup> The challenges facing leaders in Peace Support Operations are no less demanding and some like Lieutenant-General

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Department of National Defence. *Future Force: Concepts for Future Army Capabilities*. (Kingston, On, 2003), 69.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Stansfield Turner. "Convocation Address," *Naval War College Review* 51, No 1 (Winter 1998): 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> General Charles Krulak, *Presentation to the Senate Armed Services Committee: Concerning Posture*, available from http://www.fas.org/man/congress/1998/980929ck.htm; Internet; accessed 7 February 2004.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Department of National Defence. "How the Canadian Army will FIGHT: A Force Employment Concept Paper (DRAFT)." (15 January 04), 1.

Romeo Dallaire will argue, "the skills required for peace support operations demand a much broader range and depth of knowledge and a much richer set of experiences."<sup>5</sup>

In the past five years the Canadian Forces has instituted systemic changes to the Individual Professional Military Education and Development system to better prepare leaders to operate in this complex and inherently uncertain environment. The Canadian Forces has placed a priority on education through the Initial Baccalaureate Degree Program, the Army Officer Degree Program and the Officer Professional Military Education program. According to General Maurice Baril, former Chief of Defence Staff, this emphasis on education will serve to prepare leaders intellectually "to be able to cope and deal with the ambiguity and complexity of the operating environment." While the Canadian Forces is oriented towards changes in education, the Army is focused on improving and updating the individual and collective training system. These improvements have included developing an evolutionary individual training development program for both officers and non commissioned officers and establishing the Canadian Maneuver Training Centre, which will serve as the Centre for Excellence for collective training. While these changes will certainly better prepare leaders to operate in an uncertain environment, they are inadequate to meet the challenges currently facing the Army.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Romeo Dallaire. *The Theatre Commander in Conflict Resolution* Generalship and the Art of the Admiral: Perspectives on Canadian Senior Military Leadership. Ed. Bernd Horn and Stephen Harris, (Vanwell Publishing, St Catherines, 2001), 251.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Maurice Baril, *Officership: A Personal Reflection* Generalship and the Art of the Admiral: Perspectives on Canadian Senior Military Leadership. Ed. Bernd Horn and Stephen Harris, (Vanwell Publishing, St Catherines, 2001), 145.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Department of National Defence. *Advancing With Purpose: The Army Strategy*. (Director Of Land Strategic Concepts, Kingston, ON, 15 May 2002), 29.

The Army is currently facing and will face for the foreseeable future, a number of serious problems, which are having a profound impact on the Army's leadership. They are: personnel shortfalls, extremely high operational and personnel tempo, army transformation, a dwindling training budget and rising release rates.

The Canadian Army has increasing personnel shortfalls while operational tempo is the highest it has ever been. To further exacerbate this problem, the release rate for Officer Cadets, Lieutenants and Captains has risen to the highest level in the past seven years. As a result of this combination of effects, personnel tempo is at an all time high in the Army. While this is a serious problem in itself, it is further magnified by the fact that the Army's individual professional development training budget is decreasing at a time when the Army is undergoing a period of transformation that is fundamentally changing the way it fights.

The impact of this on the Army's junior leadership is significant. Lieutenants, Captains and Majors must perform increasingly more complex tasks in jobs for which they have insufficient experience or training, in organizations that are undermanned and undergoing tremendous change. Additionally, to keep pace in the field force leaders must work more efficiently and produce a higher quality of work in diverse areas without

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Lieutenant-General Jeffery, *Speaking Notes for the Address to the Conference of Defence Associations*," 22 February 2002, 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Mr. Paul Bender, National Defence Headquarters Director Strategic Human Resources 3 - Modeling & Analysis, *Officer Attrition and Survival Rates*. E Mail, 2 February 2004.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Elinor C. Sloan. "Canada and the RMA in the Revolution in Military Affairs: Implications for Canada and NATO." (McGill-Queens University Press, 2002), 138.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Colonel M. Jorgensen (Director Army Training), conversation with author, 4 Apr 04.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Department of National Defence. "How the Canadian Army will FIGHT: A Force Employment Concept Paper (DRAFT)."..., 1.

the benefit of previous experience. This has an adverse effect on job performance and satisfaction and places greater stress on the junior leadership than ever before. This has become increasingly problematic due to the lack of senior leadership involvement.

Junior officers simply do not receive adequate leader development experiences because there is diminishing direct formal and informal contact between seniors and subordinates. As a result of this lessened communication both cohesion and trust, hallmarks of the Canadian Army ethos, are diminishing. In the United States Army's experience this is directly attributable to a rising release rate for junior officers. <sup>13</sup>

What is needed to overcome these challenges is a fresh approach to individual professional development. This approach must build on current initiatives while addressing the aforementioned problems of retention, job knowledge, performance and satisfaction. An approach that has proven to be extremely successful in many corporate and military settings is mentoring. Mentoring is the most appropriate approach to address the current deficiencies in our individual professional development system, particularly within the Army. Accordingly, the aim of this paper is to argue that mentoring would be a valuable addition to the Army's Individual Professional Development system, as it would enhance individual development while addressing the serious challenges facing the Army.

To support this position the concept of mentoring will be introduced and, in the process, the term mentor will be defined and the functions of a mentor will be examined. This examination will highlight the role of the mentor and the mentor functions appropriate for implementation in the Army. After which, it will be established that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Department of the Army. *The Army Training and Leader Development Panel: Officer Study – Report to the Army...*, 2.

mentoring is a process that has proven to be a force multiplier in the United States military and civilian industry. It not only benefits the individual being mentored, commonly recognized as a protégé or mentee,<sup>14</sup> but it also provides benefits for the mentor, while improving the effectiveness and the efficiency of the organization. Finally, the two major arguments against mentoring will be examined and it will be argued that they are unfounded.

Mentoring is an old concept that has received a great deal of attention and become extremely popular in the last decade in business and educational environments. The roots of the word mentor can be traced back to Greek mythology and Homer's epic poem, The Odyssey. The term originated during the Trojan War from the name of the wise and trusted counsellor, Mentor, to whom the hero Odysseus entrusted his son Telemachus. While Odysseus fought, Mentor took over the responsibility of educating and guiding Telemachus into adulthood. Since then, the term Mentor has been associated with someone who provides guidance and counsel. In the Middle Ages the concept and principles of mentoring were evident in the master-apprentice relationship. In this relationship the master passed down the knowledge of how a task was done and it was considered a significant advantage for a young man to learn a life skill from a master.

Mentoring has garnered much attention in the past decade because of its associated benefits; however, mentoring is not commonly understood. Mentoring is many things to many people. For some a mentor is an individual who has been influential in their lives while for others it may be a vision of a senior individual who

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Margo Murray, and Marna A Owen. *Beyond The Myths and Magic of Mentoring (* Jossey-Bass Publishers, San Francisco, 1991), 13.

"favours" a chosen subordinate in order that they receive the coaching and the key jobs required for promotion.<sup>16</sup>

Mentoring has been defined in many ways. The dictionary defines a mentor as an "experienced and trusted advisor." Kathy Kram, Organizational Behavioral expert and author of "Mentoring at Work: Developmental Relationships in Organizational Life" defines mentoring as "a relationship between junior and senior colleagues, or between peers, that provide a variety of developmental functions." Similarly, recognized mentoring experts Margo Murray and Martha Owen define mentoring as "a deliberate pairing of a more skilled or experienced person with a lesser skilled or experienced one, with the agreed upon goal of having the lesser skilled person grow and develop specific competencies." Although these definitions have been around for many years they were not formally incorporated into the United States military lexicon until the publication of Field Manual (FM) 22-100 "Army Leadership: Be, Know, Do." In this FM mentoring receives considerable attention and is a major theme thus demonstrating the importance mentoring holds in the United States Army. Mentoring is defined by the United States Army as the proactive development of each subordinate through observing, assessing,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> W.E. Rosenbach, "Mentoring: Gateway to Leader Development," in *Contemporary Issues in Leadership*, ed. W.E. Rosenbach and R.L. Taylor (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1989), 139.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Steinberg, Alma and Foley, Diane. "Mentoring in the Army: From Buzzword to Practice." *Military Psychology*, Vol 11. Issue 4, (1999): 366.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Katherine Barber, *The Canadian Oxford Dictionary* (Oxford University Press, 1998), 556.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Kathy Kram, *Mentoring at Work: Developmental Relationships in Organizational Life* (Boston, MA: University Press of America, 1988), 161.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Margo Murray, and Marna A Owen. Beyond The Myths and Magic of Mentoring..., 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup>Department of the Army. *FM 22-100: Army Leadership*. Headquarters, Department of the Army, Washington, DC, August 1999.

coaching, teaching, developmental counselling and evaluation that results in people being treated with fairness and equal opportunity.<sup>21</sup>

In a similar fashion, the United States Marine Corps also has a clearly established mentoring doctrine. The Marine Corps defines mentoring as a "a program that links junior Marines with more experienced Marines for the purposes of career development and professional growth, through sharing knowledge and insights that have been learned through years." Like the other two services, the United States Air Force has recently published Air Force Policy Directive 36-34, "Air Force Mentoring Program," which defines a mentor as "a trusted counselor and guide" and mentoring as a relationship in which "a person with greater experience and wisdom guides another person to develop both personally and professionally." <sup>24</sup>

From the definitions it is clear that, although a mentor is defined in many ways, the essence of mentoring is based on an experienced and knowledgeable individual guiding and counselling a junior. Nevertheless, while the definition of a mentor establishes the basis of mentoring the functions a mentor performs establish the guidelines. These guidelines are critical as they form a common vision necessary to function or, as Gail Woods argues, based on the United States Army's experience of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Ibid, 5-15 - 5-19.

United States Marine Corps, Marine Corps University, "User's Guide to Marine Corps Values: Mentoring." Available from www.au.af.mil/au/awc/awcgate/mentor/chap07.pdf; Internet; accessed 28 January 2004.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Air Force Policy Directive 36-34 (dated 1 July 2000). "Air Force Mentoring Program." Available from http://afpubs.hq.af.mil; Internet; accessed 8 February 2004.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Air Force Space Command Handbook 36-3402, "Mentoring Handbook." Available from http://midway.spacecom.af.mil/pubs; Internet; accessed 8 February 2004.

1970's and 1980's, mentoring will become something different than it was otherwise intended to be:

It is evident that the army greatly misconceives the mentoring process as a whole. The phenomenon of mentoring is not clearly conceptualized; this leads to confusion about just what it is, what it does, and how the process works.<sup>25</sup>

A mentor performs two distinct functions: a career function and a psychosocial function. Career functions "are those aspects of the relationship that enhance learning the ropes and preparing for advancement." These functions or behaviours are commonly understood in mentoring literature to include coaching, challenging, protecting and sponsoring.

The coaching and teaching of a mentee are the most important and rewarding functions a mentor performs. It is through these processes the knowledgeable and experienced mentor instructs the mentee in specific skills and the subtleties and nuances of other skills, while providing the knowledge and insight necessary for improved job performance and professional development. Likewise, the mentor serves as a guide to challenge and assist the mentee in gaining the most from beneficial experiences while helping them avoid potential pitfalls. Other approaches to individual professional development only educate and train, while mentoring also involves nurturing a relationship.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Gail Wood, *Mentoring: A Useful Concept for Leader Development in the Army?* Strategy Research Project (Carlisle Barracks: U.S. Army War College, 11 April 1990): 75.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Kathy Kram, Mentoring at Work: Developmental Relationships in Organizational Life ..., 175.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Lea, Daniel, and Zandy B. Leibowitz. "A Mentor: Would You Know One If You Saw One?" Supervisory Management 28 (April 1983): 32-35. Lea and Leibowitz argue that mentoring is best explained by ten behaviors: teaching, guiding, advising, counseling, sponsoring, role modeling, validating, motivating, protecting and communicating.

In the early stages of a career, when socialization is extremely important, mentoring is critical as it provides an opportunity for the mentee to discuss and learn the structure and functioning of the organization from someone other than immediate superiors and colleagues. This has proven to be far more effective than discussion in a hierarchal environment as individuals are more willing and open to discussion with someone other than their immediate superior.<sup>28</sup>

Another key function of the mentor is protecting the mentee. In this instance the mentor acts as a buffer in order to provide a safe environment where the mentee can make mistakes without losing confidence. In recent years this function has broadened from a purely individualistic focus, with mentors protecting only their mentee, to one in which mentors affect systemic issues and policies to protect the greater good.<sup>29</sup> This change is best exemplified in the United States Army's move away from a zero defects mentality.

The last career function that a mentor serves is that of sponsorship. Sponsorship is a recognized career function, whereby sponsors publicly stand behind potential legacies and help improve their careers.<sup>30</sup> While many in civilian industry see sponsorship as beneficial it is an aspect of mentoring that is of limited utility to the concepts of service and selflessness espoused by military organizations. As Lieutenant General Charles W. Bagnal indicates:

The primary role of Army mentors is clearly that of coach not a sponsor. Certainly, a mentor may have profound effect on the careers of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Margo Murray and Marna A. Owen. *Beyond the Myths and Magic of Mentoring...*, 44-46.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Sean D. Naylor, "Keane Blames Leadership for Junior Officer Exodus," *Army Times*, 25 December 2000, 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Kathy Kram, Mentoring at Work: Developmental Relationships in Organizational Life ..., 189.

their protégés when they intervene to ensure that their protégés obtain desirable assignments. However, such a sponsorship role is not desirable aspect of Army mentorship because it results in perceptions of favoritism, elitism and promotion by riding the coattails of influential senior officers. This type of mentorship cannot be condoned in the Army.<sup>31</sup>

In a similar vein, General Wickham, the thirtieth Chief of Staff of the United States Army, also warned against sponsorship: "mentoring is not sponsorship or patronage. Favoritism, cronyism, or the use of one's office, position, or grade by a senior NCO, officer, or supervisor to enhance unfairly a subordinates' career over others cannot be condoned."<sup>32</sup>

While the career function is focused on goals and tasks the psychosocial function is focused at the interpersonal level and forms the heart of the long-term, trust based nature of mentoring. The psychosocial functions are "those aspects of a relationship that enhance a sense of competence, clarity of identity, and effectiveness in a professional role." These functions include role modelling, acceptance and confirmation, counselling and friendship.

Role modelling is not a new concept for the Army; however, with mentoring there is an added dimension based upon the openness of the mentoring relationship. In contrast to the normal role modelling that goes on in a leadership environment the mentor permits the mentee to observe and discuss how the mentor leads and makes decisions.

Nonetheless, the focus is not solely practical but includes the communication of values,

12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Steinberg, Alma and Foley, Diane. "Mentoring in the Army: From Buzzword to Practice." *Military Psychology*, Vol 11. Issue 4, (1999): 367.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> John A. Jr Wickham, "Collected Works of the Thirtieth Chief of Staff, United States Army." 1983-1987. Available from http://www.call.army.mil/call/csa/wickham.htm; Internet; accessed March 12, 2004.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Steinberg, Alma and Foley, Diane. "Mentoring in the Army: From Buzzword to Practice." ..., 366.

morals and ethical responsibilities, as well as, the standard of conduct, which are the hallmarks of the Army ethos. It is this dialogue between mentor and mentee that characterizes and distinguishes mentoring from other individual professional development methods.

The last psychosocial functions of mentoring are those of counselling and friendship. Unlike normal hierarchal short-term performance based relationships found within a unit, the mentoring relationship is generally lengthy in duration and enduring, built on mutual trust and open, frank communication.<sup>34</sup> Colin Powell, former Chairman of the United States Joint Chiefs of Staff and currently Secretary of State, argues that it is this bond of trust between the mentor and mentee, which underpins the personal and professional development successes fostered by mentoring and permits the mentor, during difficult periods for the mentee, to "pick'em up, dust'em off, pat'em on the back, and move'em on."<sup>35</sup>

While the roots of mentoring are deeply planted in history it is only within the last thirty years that we have heard of the importance of mentoring. Edgar F. Puryear's "19 Stars: A Study in Military Character and Leadership" clearly establishes that successful leadership includes mentoring. Leaders, like Eisenhower, Patton and Bradley would not have attained their full potential without the support and guidance of "knowledgeable and

<sup>34</sup> Johnson, Harold E. *Mentoring: For Exceptional Performance* (Griffin Publishing, Glendale California, 1997): 180.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Colin Powell, My American Journey (Ballantine Books, 1995): 46.

intelligent" seniors.<sup>36</sup> Similarly, Field Marshall Viscount Montgomery recognized, in his memoirs, the importance mentoring played in his development:

...all this goes to show how important it is for a young officer to come in contact with the best type of officer and the right influences early in his military career...In my case, the ambition was there, and the urge to master my profession. But it required advice and encouragement from the right people to set me on the road, and once that was forthcoming it was plainer sailing.<sup>37</sup>

Recently, this anecdotal evidence has been widely supported by a number of military and civilian studies, which overwhelmingly cite the importance of mentoring in the development of leaders. In a study conducted in 1999 by the United States Army Research Institute for Behavioral and Social Studies an impressive 95% of the respondents recognized the importance and benefit of mentoring. This theme was captured again in the United States Army's most recent survey "The Army Training and Leader Development Panel Officer Study Report to the Army," which concluded by highlighting the importance mentoring plays. This report suggests, "Officers believe mentoring is important for both personal and professional development." Likewise, in a study conducted by the United States Navy in 2000, 97% of the respondents, who were Navy Flag Officers, cited the importance of mentoring in leader development. 

\*\*Additional Conducted States\*\*

\*\*Additional Conducted

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Edgar F. Puryear, 19 Stars: A Study in Military Character and Leadership (Presidio, Novato, CA, 1971): 399.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Peter G. Touras, *Warriors Words*, (Cassell Arms and Armour, 1992), 252.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Alma Steinber g and Diane Foley, "Mentoring in the Army: From Buzzword to Practice." *Military Psychology...*, 372.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Department of the Army. *The Army Training and Leader Development Panel: Officer Study – Report to the Army..., 10.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Anne M. Fallow, "Mentoring Experiences Among Navy Flag Officers: A Narrative Survey Approach," Doctoral Thesis, George Fox University, 1999, 27.

the "Mentoring Experiences among Navy Midshipmen" indicated that 96% of the participants believed their improved job performance and satisfaction, and desire to remain in the military was directly attributable to mentoring. The success of mentoring has also been captured in many civilian studies. In a recent survey of Fortune 500 executives, 96% of those surveyed saw mentoring as "an important influence in their professional development."

From these mentoring studies it is clear that mentoring is perceived as tremendously important. The primary reason for this seems to be the benefits that it provides. Unlike many individual professional development processes mentoring is proven to be beneficial for the individuals involved (mentee and mentor) and for the organization as a whole. The benefits of mentoring may be divided into three distinct categories: the benefits for the mentee, the mentor and the organization.

Mentoring has a profound and positive impact on an individual.<sup>43</sup> An individual who has been mentored early in his career has a significant advantage over one who has not received the same attention. Mentees are typically more confident and knowledgeable and develop a more mature thought process than those who have not been mentored.<sup>44</sup> Major-General Schachnow, a former Commanding General of the United States John F. Kennedy Special Warfare Center, believes that the benefits of mentoring

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> B. Johnson, R, Lall, E, Homes, and M, Nordlund. "Mentoring Experiences among Navy Midshipmen." *Military Medicine*, Vol 166, (January 2001): 27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Gregg Martin, George E Reed, Ruth E Collins, and Cortez Dial. "The Road to Mentoring: Paved with Good Intentions." *Parameters*, (Autumn 2002), 115.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Anne M. Fallow, "Mentoring Experiences Among Navy Flag Officers,"..., 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Kathy Kram, Mentoring at Work: Developmental Relationships in Organizational Life ..., 189.

include, but are not limited to, "increased confidence, improved leadership, management, communication and a broader perspective and understanding of the Army." <sup>45</sup>

Likewise, mentoring has a profound effect during the socialization phase and in the military context this has great appeal for newly recruited officers. In a study conducted with Cadets at the United States Military Academy mentoring "increased the competence and professionalism of cadets entering active duty and helps reduce the negative impacts associated with assimilation." As well, mentoring was found to reduce the attrition rates at the Academy.

Moreover, improvements in confidence and knowledge lead to improvements in job performance and job satisfaction, which in the United States Army's experience correlated to increased retention.<sup>48</sup> Again, these benefits are directly attributable to the coaching that goes on between a mentor and mentee.

The mentoring relationship provides the mentee the occasion to discuss and develop the skills and knowledge that are required to operate in today's Army. Indeed, it is this exchange that is seen as the greatest benefit that mentoring offers. In a study entitled, "The Mentoring Experiences Among Navy Flag Officers" 83% of the participants responded that they benefited from the mentoring experience. This experience provided them with "critical guidance about career decisions, the inspiration

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Major-General Schachnow, "Mentoring: Critical Assistance in the SOF Community," Special *Warfare*, Vol 12, No. 2 (Spring 1999): 38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Steven M. Jones, "Improving Accountability for Improved Command Climate: A Strategic Imperative," Available from http://www.carlisle.army.mil/ssi/pubs/ 2003/improvng/improvng.pdf; Internet; accessed 12 March 2004.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Matthew Hale, "Mentoring Junior Leaders: Leadership Tools for Our 21<sup>st</sup> Century Army," (U.S. Army War College, Carlisle Barracks, 2001), 1.

to do well, the encouragement in their professional growth and the opportunity to observe the mentor's example of leadership." Many respondents summarized the impact of their mentoring relationship as the reason for their enhanced performance and success. Arguably one of the best examples, which provides evidence of the synergistic effect of mentoring, is the relationship between General Dwight D. Eisenhower and Generals Fox Conner and George C. Marshall. Through contact with these gifted and senior officers when he was relatively junior General Eisenhower developed into one of the most brilliant and accomplished military officers of the twentieth century. Still, he is by no means the only example of the power of mentorship. There are arguably thousands of others, to include, such notable personalities as: George H.W. Bush whom Richard M. Nixon mentored; Condoleezza Rice whom Brent Scowcroft mentored; Dick Cheney whom Donald Rumsfeld mentored; and Colin Powell whom Caspar Weinberger and Frank Carlucci mentored. 151

While the benefits for the individual are truly powerful the relationship is equally transformational and beneficial for the mentor. Through the mentoring relationship the mentor develops a much better understanding of contemporary issues. Mentors become acutely aware of the thought processes of a younger generation, as well as, how they deal with problems along with the challenges they are facing. An understanding of these perceptions not only enriches a mentor's understanding of a major portion of the organization, but it provides an opportunity to examine new ways of thinking about

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Anne M. Fallow, "Mentoring Experiences Among Navy Flag Officers,"..., 30.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Anne M. Fallow, "Mentoring Experiences Among Navy Flag Officers,"..., 31.

issues and problems. By examining problems from a new perspective leaders can make more thoughtful decisions.<sup>52</sup> Furthermore, the mentor gets instant and honest feedback regarding what is working well in the organization and what isn't. These insights are invaluable in improving the effectiveness and efficiency of the organization and in achieving organizational goals and objectives.

There are also significant second order benefits for the mentor. The mentor receives personal satisfaction from sharing expertise and experiences and in helping less experienced persons.<sup>53</sup> This translates into an increased sense of pride and personal worth, and often a "rejuvenated outlook."<sup>54</sup> Last of all, the mentor gets the benefit of knowing that, "giving of ourselves by sharing our knowledge and experience is the most important legacy we can leave to those who follow."<sup>55</sup>

Besides benefiting the mentee and mentor, mentoring will benefit the organization. Mentoring has proven to improve morale and enhance the experience and competence of the organization, as well as opening up the lines of communication between senior and junior officers.<sup>56</sup> Not only does mentoring contribute to personal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Major Charles J Dalcourt. "Mentoring: Establishing a Legacy, Shaping the Future." Military Review, (Nov/Dec 2002): 37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Lon E. Maggart. "Mentoring – A Critical Element in Leader Development," *Military Review* Vol 79, No. 3 (May/June, 1999): 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Brad Johnson, Jennifer Huwe, Anne Fallow, Rakesh Lall, Captain Holmes, and William Hall, "Does Mentoring Foster Success?" *U.S. Naval Institute Proceedings*, Vol. 125, Issue 12, (Dec 99): 86 – 89.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Treasury Board of Canada, *Guidelines for the Development of a Mentoring Program* (Ottawa: Minister of Supply and Services, 1995), 10.

John A. Jr Wickham, "Collected Works of the Thirtieth Chief of Staff, United States Army." 1983-1987. Available from http://call.army.mil/call/csa/wickham.htm; Internet; accessed March 12, 2004.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Kathy Kram, *Mentoring at Work: Developmental Relationships in Organizational Life* ...,189-210.

growth, but it has been instrumental in the professional growth of the United States Army's officer corps and to the strengthening of Army values.<sup>57</sup>

Likewise, the synergistic effect of a highly competent, confident and satisfied workforce translates into increased loyalty to the organization and improved retention rates. Mentoring has played a pivotal role in reducing the release rate of Lieutenants and Captains in the United States Army. At a time when the Canadian Army is facing strong competition from the private sector in recruiting and having a very difficult time retaining its members, this benefit is extremely attractive. <sup>59</sup>

It is necessary to recognize that the benefits of mentoring go far beyond the target individual and for that reason it is a force multiplier. Although the individual reaps great rewards in terms of improved confidence and self-esteem, job knowledge and job satisfaction, the benefits for the mentor and the organization are equally impressive and transformational. However, while studies indicate overwhelming support for mentoring and its importance in leader development there are some who believe that mentoring is not useful. This opinion is generally founded on one of two arguments.

The first argument against mentoring is based on the belief that mentoring is nothing but "cronyism," favoritism," and "nepotism." This opinion runs through many of the mentoring studies presented herein and is shared by some senior United States

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Department of the Army. *The Army Training and Leader Development Panel: Officer Study – Report to the Army..., 10-12.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Anne M. Fallow, "Mentoring Experiences Among Navy Flag Officers,"..., 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Department of National Defence, "Preparing for the Future." Available from http://www.forces.gc.ca/site/about/future e.asp; Internet; accessed 3 April 04.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Gregg Martin, George E Reed, Ruth E Collins, and Cortez Dial. "The Road to Mentoring: Paved with Good Intentions."..., 3.

Navy Flag Officers.<sup>61</sup> Indeed, this argument is well founded in an organization that does not have well established mentoring doctrine; however, in organizations that have well developed mentoring doctrine, that clearly establish the role and functions of the mentor, this argument is unfounded.<sup>62</sup>

The other argument against mentoring is based on the premise that our current leadership and counselling practices are adequate and therefore mentoring is not needed. However, as it has been described, mentoring is quite different from what currently goes on in the Army. The relationship that develops between mentee and mentor is far different from that of superior and subordinate. It is more intimate, open, honest and long term. Consequently, it achieves benefits, in counselling for example, that our current performance oriented system cannot achieve.<sup>63</sup>

In conclusion, the Canadian Forces has done much to meet the challenges posed by the new security environment; however, these advances have done little to address the challenges facing the Army. To overcome these challenges a fresh approach to individual professional development is needed and a concept that has proven to be extremely successful in many corporate and military settings is mentoring. Mentoring was introduced and in the process it was established that although a mentor is defined in many ways the essence of mentoring is based on an experienced and knowledgeable individual guiding and counselling a junior. The functions a mentor performs were then examined and it was established that the career functions of coaching, challenging and

<sup>61</sup> Anne M. Fallow, "Mentoring Experiences Among Navy Flag Officers,"..., 41 – 42.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Margo Murray and Marna A. Owen. *Beyond the Myths and Magic of Mentoring...*, 26 - 29.

 $<sup>^{63}</sup>$  Major-General Schachnow, "Mentoring: Critical Assistance in the SOF Community," Special Warfare..., 36.

protecting and the psychosocial functions of role modeling, acceptance, confirmation, are extremely valuable to the army, while the function of sponsorship offers little utility. It was then established, after a review of a number of United States military and civilian studies, that mentoring is recognized as tremendously important in the development of junior leaders. It has been proven that mentoring has a profound and positive impact on the individual by improving confidence, self-esteem, job knowledge and satisfaction. Indeed, it was established that mentoring is equally transformational and beneficial for the mentor, and these benefits translate into a highly competent, confident and satisfied workforce, which is more efficient and effective than one without a mentoring program. It is for these reasons that mentoring may be aptly identified as a force multiplier and recognized as an approach that would be a valuable addition to the Army's Individual Professional Development system.

21

# **Bibliography**

# **Books**

- Baril, Maurice. *Officership: A Personal Reflection*. Ed. Bernd Horn and Stephen Harris. Generalship and the Art of the Admiral: Perspectives on Canadian Senior Military Leadership. St Catherines, Vanwell, 2001.
- Canada, Treasury Board of Canada. *Guidelines for the Development of a Mentoring Program*, BT 49-17/1996, Ministry of Supply and Services Canada, 1995.
- Canada, Department of National Defence. *Canada's Army*. B-GL-300-000/FP-000, Ottawa, On, 1998.
- Canada, Department of National Defence. Future Force: Concepts for Future Army Capabilities. Director Of Land Strategic Concepts, Kingston, ON, 2003.
- Canada, Department of National Defence. How the Canadian Army will FIGHT: A Force Employment Concept Paper (DRAFT). 15 January 04.
- Canada, Department of National Defence. Strategic Assessment 2001. September 2001.
- Canada, Department of National Defence. *Advancing With Purpose: The Army Strategy*. Director Of Land Strategic Concepts, Kingston, ON, 15 May 2002.
- Dallaire, Romeo. "The Theatre Commander in Conflict Resolution." Ed. Bernd Horn and Stephen Harris. <u>Generalship and the Art of the Admiral: Perspectives on Canadian Senior Military Leadership</u>. St Catherines, Vanwell, 2001.
- Fallow, Anne M. "Mentoring Experiences Among Navy Flag Officers: A Narrative Survey Approach," Doctoral Thesis, George Fox University, 1999.
- Gail Wood, *Mentoring: A Useful Concept for Leader Development in the Army?*.

  Strategy Research Project, Carlisle Barracks: U.S. Army War College, 11 April 1990.
- Johnson, Harold E. *Mentoring: For Exceptional Performance*. Griffin Publishing, Glendale California, 1997.
- Kram, Kathy. *Mentoring at Work: Developmental Relationships in Organizational Life*. Boston, MA: University Press of America, 1988.
- Murray, Margo and Owen, Marna A. *Beyond The Myths and Magic of Mentoring*. Jossey-Bass Publishers, San Francisco, 1991.
- Puryear, Edgar F. Jr. 19 Stars: A Study in Military Character and Leadership. Presidio,

- Press, Novato, CA, 1971.
- Puryear, Edgar F. Jr. American Generalship: Character is Everything: The Art of Command. Presidio, Novato, CA, 2000.
- Rosenbach, W.E., "Mentoring: Gateway to Leader Development," in *Contemporary Issues in Leadership*, ed. W.E. Rosenbach and R.L. Taylor, Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1989.
- Sharpe, BGen (Retired) Joe and English, Allan D. *Principles for Change in the Post-Cold War and Command and Control of the Canadian Forces*. Canadian Forces Leadership Institute, Ottawa, ON, 2002.
- Sloan, Elinor. Canada and the RMA in the Revolution in Military Affairs: Implications for Canada and NATO. McGill and Queens University Press, 2002.
- Stone, Florence M. *Coaching, Counseling and Mentoring*. American Management Association, New York, 1999.
- Tsouras, Peter G. Warrior's Words. Cassell Arms and Armour, 1992.
- United States, Department of the Army. *Commissioned Officer Development and Career Management: Pamphlet 600-3*. Headquarters, Department of the Army, Washington, DC, 1 Oct 1998.
- United States, Department of the Army. *FM 22-100: Army Leadership*. Headquarters, Department of the Army, Washington, DC, August 1999.

### **Articles in Journals**

- Chilcoat, Richard. "The Fourth Army War College: Preparing Strategic Leaders for the Next Century." *Parameters*, (Winter 1995-96): 3 17.
- Dalcourt, Major Charles J. "Mentoring: Establishing a Legacy, Shaping the Future." *Military Review*, (Nov/Dec 2002): 35 39.
- Hale, Matthew T. *Mentoring Junior Leaders: Leadership Tools for Our 21<sup>st</sup> Century Army*. Strategy Research Project. Carlisle Barracks: U.S. Army War College, April 2001.
- Johnson, Brad., Huwe, Jennifer., Fallow, Anne., Lall, Rakesh., Holmes, Captain Elizabeth, and Hall, William. "Does Mentoring Foster Success?" *U.S. Naval Institute Proceedings*, Vol. 125, Issue 12, (Dec 99): 86 89.
- Johnson, B., Lall, R., Homes, E. and Nordlund, M. "Mentoring Experiences among

- Navy Midshipmen." *Military Medicine*, Vol 166, (January 2001): 27 31.
- Lea, Daniel, and Zandy B. Leibowitz. "A Mentor: Would You Know One If You Saw One?" *Supervisory Management*, (April 1983): 32-35.
- Kem, Jack D. "Mentoring: Building a Legacy." *Military Review*, Vol. 3, Issue 4, (Jul/Aug 2003): 62 65.
- Kopser, Joseph G. "Mentoring in the Military: Not Everybody Gets It." *Military Review Command and General Staff College*, (Nov/Dec 2002).
- Maggart, Lon E. "Mentoring A Critical Element in Leader Development." *Military Review*, Vol. 79, Issue 3, (May/June 99): 44 48.
- Martin, Greff F., Reed, George E., Collins, Ruth E, and Dial, Cortez. "The Road to Mentoring: Paved with Good Intentions." *Parameters*, (Autumm 2002): 115 127.
- Naylor, Sean D. "Keane Blames Leadership for Junior Officer Exodus," *Army Times*, 25 December 2000.
- Rosello, Victor M. "Mentoring and Counseling: A Tag Team Approach to Professional Development." *Military Intelligence*, (July September 1996).
- Schachnow, Major General, "Mentoring: Critical Assistance in the SOF Community," *Special Warfare*, Vol 12, No. 2 (Spring 1999).
- Steinberg, Alma and Foley, Diane. "Mentoring in the Army: From Buzzword to Practice." *Military Psychology*, Vol 11. Issue 4, (1999): 365 380.
- Ulmer, Walter. "Military Leadership into the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: Another Bridge Too Far?" *Parameters*, (Spring 1998): 4–25.

# **Internet Sources**

- Air Force Policy Directive 36-34 (dated 1 July 2000). "Air Force Mentoring Program." Available from http://afpubs.hq.af.mil; Internet; accessed 8 February 2004.
- Air Force Space Command Handbook 36-3402. "Mentoring Handbook." Available from http://midway.spacecom.af.mil/pubs; Internet; accessed 8 February 2004.
- Adams, Darrell E. "Mentoring Women and Minority Officers in the US Military." Available from www.au.af.mil/au/awc/awcgate/acsc/97-0607b.pdf; Internet; accessed January 28, 2004.
- Bailey, Lt Col Penny H. "Mentoring Makes a Difference." Available from

- http://www.airpower.maxwell.af.mil/airchronicles/cc/bailey.html; Internet; accessed February 1, 2004.
- Department of the Army. "The Army Training and Leader Development Panel: Officer Study Report to the Army." Available from http://www.army.mil/features/ATLDPCiv/; Internet; accessed 26 February 2004.
- Jones, Steven M. "Improving Accountability for Improved Command Climate: A Strategic Imperative," Available from http://www.carlisle.army.mil/ssi/pubs/2003/improvng/improvng.pdf; Internet; accessed 12 March 2004.
- Krulak, General Charles. "Presentation to the Senate Armed Services Committee: Concerning Posture" Available from http://www.fas.org/man/congress/1998/980929ck.htm; Internet; accessed 7 February 2004
- Sullivan, LCDR Mary Maureen. "Mentoring in the Military: A Preliminary Study of Gender Differences." Available from http://www.au.af.mil/au/awc/awcgate/mentor/mentors.html; Internet; accessed January 26, 2004.
- United States Department of Defence. "JOINT VISION 2010: America's Military Preparing for Tomorrow." Available from http://www.dtic.mil/jv2010/jvpub.htm; Internet; accessed 18 January 2004.
- United States Marine Corps, Marine Corps University. "User's Guide to Marine Corps Values: Mentoring." Available from www.au.af.mil/au/awc/awcgate/mentor/chap07.pdf; Internet; accessed January 28, 2004.
- Wickham, John A. Jr. "Collected Works of the Thirtieth Chief of Staff, United States Army." 1983-1987. Available from http://call.army.mil/call/csa/wickham.htm; Internet; accessed March 12, 2004.