

Canadian  
Forces  
College

Collège  
des  
Forces  
Canadiennes



## HEARTS AND MINDS ONE CONTRACT AT A TIME – OPTIMIZING PROCUREMENT EFFECTS IN A COUNTERINSURGENCY

LCol U.R. Leblond-Fortin

**JCSP 44**

***Exercise Solo Flight***

**Disclaimer**

Opinions expressed remain those of the author and do not represent Department of National Defence or Canadian Forces policy. This paper may not be used without written permission.

© Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada, as represented by the Minister of National Defence, 2018.

**PCEMI 44**

***Exercice Solo Flight***

**Avertissement**

Les opinions exprimées n'engagent que leurs auteurs et ne reflètent aucunement des politiques du Ministère de la Défense nationale ou des Forces canadiennes. Ce papier ne peut être reproduit sans autorisation écrite.

© Sa Majesté la Reine du Chef du Canada, représentée par le ministre de la Défense nationale, 2018.

CANADIAN FORCES COLLEGE – COLLÈGE DES FORCES CANADIENNES

JCSP 44 – PCEMI 44

8 May 2018

DS 549 Solo Flight

**HEARTS AND MINDS ONE CONTRACT AT A TIME – OPTIMIZING  
PROCUREMENT EFFECTS IN A COUNTERINSURGENCY**

By Lieutenant-Colonel U.R. Leblond-Fortin

*“This paper was written by a candidate attending the Canadian Forces College in fulfilment of one of the requirements of the Course of Studies. The paper is a scholastic document, and thus contains facts and opinions, which the author alone considered appropriate and correct for the subject. It does not necessarily reflect the policy or the opinion of any agency, including the Government of Canada and the Canadian Department of National Defence. This paper may not be released, quoted or copied, except with the express permission of the Canadian Department of National Defence.”*

*“La présente étude a été rédigée par un stagiaire du Collège des Forces canadiennes pour satisfaire à l'une des exigences du cours. L'étude est un document qui se rapporte au cours et contient donc des faits et des opinions que seul l'auteur considère appropriés et convenables au sujet. Elle ne reflète pas nécessairement la politique ou l'opinion d'un organisme quelconque, y compris le gouvernement du Canada et le ministère de la Défense nationale du Canada. Il est défendu de diffuser, de citer ou de reproduire cette étude sans la permission expresse du ministère de la Défense nationale.”*

Word Count: 5334

Nombre de mots: 5334

## HEARTS AND MINDS ONE CONTRACT AT A TIME – OPTIMIZING PROCUREMENT EFFECTS IN A COUNTERINSURGENCY

*“The economy, stupid.”*

- James Carville, 1992

### Introduction

According to the current Canadian Armed Forces defence policy, *Strong, Secure, Engaged*, conflicts are becoming more complex, fought in the grey areas, and the variety of actors involved in the conflict has never been more numerous.<sup>1</sup> This policy, in line with associated funding and an evolution in doctrine and procedures for the Canadian Armed Forces and it will be better prepared to fulfill its role in the future.

However, it is also important to remember that, in the past 15 years, Canadian soldiers have been involved in counter insurgency warfare, whether in Afghanistan or Iraq. Lessons were learned, but, as the military re-focuses on the potential of state on state conflict,<sup>2</sup> some of those lessons risk being put aside to make room for more conventional issues. One such lesson is related to the use of economic development and reconstruction to create stability, or, as Bill Clinton’s presidential Campaign manager reminded his staff in 1992: “The Economy, stupid.” For example, Iraq has been devastated by the war against Daesh to the point where its government says that it will cost 88 billion dollars to rebuild. Canada announced that it will contribute 12 million via the United Nations and the United States will provide no funding whatsoever.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Canada, *Strong, Secure, Engaged: Canada's Defence Policy* (Ottawa, Ont.: National Defence = Défense nationale, 2017), 52.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid. 50.

<sup>3</sup> Janice Dickson, “Freeland announces 12 million for reconstruction efforts in Iraq,” iPolitics, 13 February 2018. <https://ipolitics.ca/2018/02/13/freeland-announces-12-million-reconstruction-efforts-iraq/>

Considering the amounts involved, would it not be sensible to try and facilitate economic reconstruction as the counter-insurgency is being fought? Would it not be sensible to consider all of the resources already expended to fight the insurgency in that reconstruction mix and maximize its effect on economic development so that post-conflict re-construction would be easier and less costly? The answer to these questions are, of course, yes, but the difficulty is which resources are suitable to serve that purpose and how to harness them. This paper will argue that logistical support provided through local contracting is a resource that can have a significant effect in stabilizing a region through the facilitation of sustainable economic development. To support this argument, theory on fighting counter-insurgencies and the concept of reconstruction will be presented. This paper will then endeavour to quantify the effect that can be achieved considering the size and scope of those procurement activities in the context of a conflict affected economy. Finally, this paper will investigate how, in the Canadian Armed Forces context, this approach could be applied.

### **The many sides of the COIN**

The forthcoming paragraphs of this paper will present the theoretical underpinnings of the way western militaries view what counterinsurgencies are and how to best fight them. Specifically, a quick tour of the application of national power and the concept of “Smart Power”<sup>4</sup> and how a country chooses which instrument in that context is in order. Then, this paper will conduct a review of counterinsurgency theory and of the concepts of comprehensive approach, reconstruction and human security, within it. As all of these activities need to occur in an insecure environment, it also is necessary to see if

---

<sup>4</sup> Joseph Nye Jr. *The Powers to Lead : Soft, Hard, and Smart*. Cary: Oxford University Press, 2008.

even the ‘softer’ tasks can still be accomplished with security lacking. These fundamental theories will help highlight the necessary knowledge necessary to define applied solutions, such as a better use of the resources expanded in the fight against an insurgent force.

It is first necessary to shed light on why countries get involved in counterinsurgencies in the first place, especially within an expeditionary context. One key theory at play here is Joseph Nye’s Soft power concept within his Smart power theory. He defines soft power as a way to influence by having other significant actors wanting to emulate the states that possesses that attraction, allowing the latter to have their way on the international stage.<sup>5</sup> In that sense, one of the reasons a country would get involved into a counterinsurgency fight within another state would be based on the desire to maintain that Soft Power capital and be seen as a good global citizen. An example of this is the recent announcement that Canada would involve itself in Mali as part of a UN force. Retired Canadian Armed Forces General, Canadian Senator and proponent of peacekeeping Roméo Dallaire was quoted saying: “We’re into assisting nations [to] resolve a conflict that is in their territory,”<sup>6</sup> offering an image of Canada as a nation that helps others.

Although motivation to engage in COIN is a very necessary step for involvement, it is also important to understand, from a theoretical standpoint, an insurgency is and how one affect its defeat. David Galula, a French officer and academic that lived from 1919 to

---

<sup>5</sup> Joseph S. Nye, Jr, *Soft Power: The Means of Success in World Politics* (New York: Public Affairs, 2004), 5.

<sup>6</sup> Canadian Broadcasting Corporation (CBC), “Should Canada risk soldiers’ lives in its peacekeeping mission in Mali?”, Last modified 20 March 2018, <http://www.cbc.ca/radio/thecurrent/the-current-for-march-20-2018-1.4583785/should-canada-risk-soldiers-lives-in-its-peacekeeping-mission-in-mali-1.4583883>

1967, wrote “Counterinsurgency Warfare, theory and practice”<sup>7</sup> that attempts to describe this phenomenon and is still considered a critical work in the field. Essentially, an insurgency, or “revolutionary war” is an internal conflict with outside involvement that sees a large discrepancy in the military power of its actors. This discrepancy leads to a variety of issues when it comes to defeating the insurgency as the counterinsurgent force has the burden of an illegitimate past, amplifying any mistakes where the insurgent is not judged as harshly on what it does. Galula also points out to the fact that underdeveloped economies tend to favour the guerilla type of fighting as the lack of infrastructure hinders any efforts of the counterinsurgent to reach the affected regions. He then offers that, to achieve success, the force fighting the insurgency must use all of its might, including, but not limited to, military, economic, information and propaganda in order to establish itself among the population as a legitimate actor. This can be accomplished very rapidly through economic and social programs that are needed, or better, demanded by the populations that the insurgent rely as a support base.<sup>8</sup>

Alternatively, John Mackinley, a teaching fellow at the Kings College War Studies department, proposes four characteristics to an insurgency. To him, they are mostly political, their tactics are specific to the location they are from, are an act of desperation as a solution to the failings of the current regime, and rely on popular support.<sup>9</sup> When understood in that context, one can rapidly realize that any hope of resolution of an insurgency has to include the use of tools that are outside the typical military spectrum.

---

<sup>7</sup> David Galula and John A. Nagl, *Counterinsurgency Warfare : Theory and Practice*. (Westport, CT: Praeger Security International, 2006) –page number of quote missing.

<sup>8</sup> Ibid, 1, 6, 9, 24-64.

<sup>9</sup> John Mackinlay, *The Insurgent Archipelago: From Mao to Bin Laden* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2009), 5.

As the activities necessary to fight an insurgency are broader than the typical skillset of a conventional military force, the concept of a comprehensive approach to conflict resolution was introduced. Canadian Forces Joint Publication 01 defines a 'comprehensive approach' as a having a common understanding of the enduring end states and the strategy to get there, by all actors involved in a conflict resolution. Those actors could be military, other government departments, international organizations, such as the United Nations or NATO and even Non-Governmental Organizations.<sup>10</sup>

One of the key tools used by a comprehensive approach is the reconstruction efforts of a country devastated by an insurgency. Retired United States Army Major-General Eric Olson studied the question of reconstruction following his time as Commander of the 25<sup>th</sup> Infantry Division (light) in Afghanistan. In the same vein as Galula, he argues that reconstruction can take away the insurgent's ascent on the population<sup>11</sup> and he offers the example of CORDS in Vietnam where large amounts of resources were provided to the South-Vietnamese for them to conduct the reconstruction caused by the war with the North. With a budget of 1.3B USD at its peak and more than 5000 US advisors, this was a significant effort that was hampered in the end by poor evaluation methods of its success. It does however emphasize that counterinsurgency is the fight for the support of the population, to deny it or take it away from the insurgents and providing for the populations need through reconstruction is a viable strategy.<sup>12</sup>

---

<sup>10</sup> Department of National Defence, CFJP-01, Canadian Military Doctrine (Ottawa: DND Canada, 2011), GL-2.

<sup>11</sup> Eric T. Olson and Army War College (U.S.). Strategic Studies Institute, *Some of the Best Weapons for Counterinsurgents do Not Shoot* (Carlisle, PA: Strategic Studies Institute, U.S. Army War College, 2010), 6

<sup>12</sup> Ibid, 24-25, 42-43.

To address this issue of performance, Major Bodnar and Major Gwinn, while employed as economics instructors at West Point, decided to study this issue by looking at the reconstruction programs that were used during the insurgency between the Philippine government and the Moro National Liberation Front. They looked at three aspects to measure the effectiveness of the reconstruction programs: “infrastructure development, workforce preparation, and former combatant reintegration.”<sup>13</sup> Their conclusion after analysis is that, reconstruction and economic development is effective when done in a way that legitimizes the local government which is in line with what Galula was positing with regards to social programs in the Algerian conflict; namely, that the local government needs to be able to maintain these gains, otherwise the insurgents will use it against it.<sup>14</sup>

An issue with the use of economic development is that it needs to be just the right amount, while legitimizing the government. In order to achieve this, Lieutenant Colonel Long, a US special forces officer during his time in a doctoral program at the University of North Carolina, does offer the “Dry Sponge Theory.”<sup>15</sup> He argues that, in Afghanistan, for example, even with the injection of 3B USD, the country is not improved by that amount as the economy was simply not able to absorb the resources, which exacerbated corruption and other issues. He therefore proposes that this influx of reconstruction resources be done in a deliberately slow manner to have it absorbed more thoroughly by

---

<sup>13</sup> Seth Bodnar and Jeremy Gwinn, “‘Monetary Ammunition’ in a Counterinsurgency,” *Parameters* 40, no. 3 (2010): 91, 4.

<sup>14</sup> David Galula and John A. Nagl, *Counterinsurgency Warfare: Theory and Practice*. Westport, CT: Praeger Security International, 2006), 10, 55.

<sup>15</sup> Joseph Long, “The Dry Sponge Theory: Maximizing the use of Money as a Weapon System’ in Coin,” *Special Warfare* 26, no. 4 (2013): 32.

the economy and, therefore, enabling the local government to gain legitimacy in the process.<sup>16</sup>

On the other hand, it is often argued that reconstruction cannot happen before security is fully established. The main argument is along the lines that reconstruction is very hard to protect and exposes many civilians to the insurgents and makes them clear targets. The author's experience in Afghanistan in 2010-11 confirms this statement, for example, the construction of Hyena Road within the Kandahar province did require a large amount of protection and was attacked frequently.<sup>17</sup> However, as the issue to be resolved is one of legitimacy of the local government, positive progress that directly affect the population is necessary; otherwise, the insurgent will likely use this lack of economic progress to its advantage.<sup>18</sup> So, re-construction may cause security risks, but is necessary to support the legitimacy of the government in place.

As it can be seen, intervention to resolve an insurgency is, for a western democracy like Canada, a matter of maintaining its Soft Power. As an insurgency is a struggle between largely different actors, it is necessary that a counterinsurgency gets the local population on its side and in order to do so, reconstruction is a key mean available within a comprehensive approach to human security. However, there has been some issues in the past with counterinsurgent investments within a country as it was either improperly measured or the local economy could not absorb the help that was provided, leading to further reflection as to how to best maximize the effect of all resources invested in this type of conflict.

---

<sup>16</sup> Ibid, 34-35.

<sup>17</sup> Based on author's professional experiences as.....[give your role/title]

<sup>18</sup> David Galula and John A. Nagl. *Counterinsurgency Warfare : Theory and Practice*. Westport, CT: Praeger Security International, 2006. 6.

## Indirect Investments

How does a counterinsurgent ensure that all the resources expended in its fight are channeled in support of its objective of defeating the insurrection? This section will address this by, first, explaining the economic context within a failed state where an insurgency happened. It will then investigate one of the largest resource expenditure that happens when a counterinsurgency force is employed, and it is its logistical support. Specifically, how does it affect the environment and, can it be used in a more effective way to support operations. It will then be contrasted against the current practice of direct investment that is done as part of the comprehensive approach introduced above.

Rebuilding the economy of a country is often presented as a large part of the solution to a peaceful environment.<sup>19</sup> As such, an understanding of how one can recognize that the environment in which one is operating is a failed economy is key to understand if economic reconstruction is even necessary. One such tool has been setup by “The Fund For Peace,” an independent research organization that has been focussed on understanding what makes a failing state for more than 60 years.<sup>20</sup> Of the twelve indicators that they use, three of them are specifically economic in nature: “Economic Decline, Uneven Economic Development and Human Flight and Brain Drain” and three more have economic undertones with: “Public service, Demographic Pressures and External Intervention” all having significant impacts on the viability of the states while

---

<sup>19</sup>Dorothea Hilhorst, Ian Christoplos, and Gemma Van Der Haar. "Reconstruction 'from Below': A New Magic Bullet Or Shooting from the Hip?" *Third World Quarterly* 31, no. 7 (2010): 1108.

<sup>20</sup>Fund for Peace, “About the Fund For Peace”, last accessed on 23 April 2018, <http://global.fundforpeace.org/aboutus>

affecting or requiring a significant fiscal support.<sup>21</sup> These markers do provide a form of roadmap of economic development that can help in mitigating an insurgency.

When a military commander realizes that the operations are undertaken in a failing economy, how to address this issue while providing the secure environment that the counterinsurgent is expected to provide becomes a difficult balance to achieve. The US, having published doctrine under the moniker: “Money as a weapon system”<sup>22</sup> in 2009, focussed on training the warfighters in ways to find unfilled economic or social needs, create a solution and get it funded through a bureaucratic process.<sup>23</sup> The main issue at play here is this approach is only looking at direct action to resolve the problem and not the environment this action is taken in.

It is important to realize how much impact, in economic terms an expeditionary counterinsurgency force has on a country. For example, the expenditures associated with support of the forces deployed to Afghanistan for US CENTCOM in 2010 were 105 B USD<sup>24</sup> where humanitarian donations from US donors in the same period were estimated at 156.4 M USD.<sup>25</sup> Considering that the GDP of Afghanistan at the time was 15.94 Billion,<sup>26</sup> it is clear that the money spent by the US, and even more so when including the

---

<sup>21</sup> Fund for Peace, “Indicators”, last accessed on 23 April 2018, <http://fundforpeace.org/fsi/indicators/>

<sup>22</sup> Term attributed to Gen David Patraeus. Joseph Long, "The Dry Sponge Theory: Maximizing the use of Money as a Weapon System' in Coin." *Special Warfare* 26, no. 4 (2013): 32.

<sup>23</sup> Ibid. 33.

<sup>24</sup> Railways of Afghanistan, “Military Logistics in Afghanistan”, last accessed on 24 Apr 2018, <http://www.andrewgrantham.co.uk/afghanistan/military-logistics-in-afghanistan/>

<sup>25</sup> CARINA SOLMIRANO and JAKOB HALLGREN. *Assessing the Cost of Military Operations in Afghanistan and Juxtaposing them to the Assessed Costs of Humanitarian Assistance (2008-2012)*.

<sup>26</sup> Trading Economics, “Afghanistan GDP”, last accessed on 24 April 2018, <https://tradingeconomics.com/afghanistan/gdp>

coalition within Afghanistan had a significant impact on economic development and could be a great enabler to the counterinsurgent.

Most research on the subject of economic development is related to what this paper will call direct investment. There is even a whole for-profit industry related to this approach.<sup>27</sup> The basis of these theories, whether it is a top down or bottom up approach or a hybrid, seeks to identify the areas of need and, through funding, help develop solutions to the economic or social imbalance.<sup>28</sup> These methods were applied with success in areas like the Philippines, where programs such as USAID “Growth with Equity in Mindanao” helped bring an insurgency to a close.<sup>29</sup> However, a major issue with these programs is that they require funds specifically identified for that purpose. Another issue is that, often, the donors of these funds also have specific biases and agendas, which limits its availability as part of a comprehensive approach, or at least, the synchronization of effects is, at best, difficult.<sup>30</sup> And finally, as stated above, since legitimacy of the local institutions is essential, the fact that most direct investment program will have outside oversight works at cross purposes here. These limitations are not crippling, but they bear keeping in mind when establishing a comprehensive strategy to solve the insurgency.

On the other hand, if military forces are committed to stop a counterinsurgency, logistical support will be provided to them which leads to money being spent within the

---

<sup>27</sup> Vijay Kumar Nagaraj "‘Beltway Bandits’ and ‘Poverty Barons’: For-Profit International Development Contracting and the Military-Development Assemblage." *Development and Change* 46, no. 4 (2015): 585-617.

<sup>28</sup> Dorothea Hilhorst, Ian Christoplos, and Gemma Van Der Haar. "Reconstruction 'from Below': A New Magic Bullet Or Shooting from the Hip?" *Third World Quarterly* 31, no. 7 (2010): 1107-1113.

<sup>29</sup> Seth Bodnar, and Jeremy Gwinn. "'Monetary Ammunition' in a Counterinsurgency." *Parameters* 40, no. 3 (2010): 91, 4.

<sup>30</sup> Barakat, Sultan. "The Failed Promise of Multi-Donor Trust Funds: Aid Financing as an Impediment to Effective State-Building in Post-Conflict Contexts." *Policy Studies* 30, no. 2 (2009): 107-126.

area of operations to provide that support. The primary role of these expenditures is the provision of the sustainment needed by the military force,<sup>31</sup> but that does not prevent a better targeting of where the money is spent. For example, COMISAF felt the need to issue contracting directives in support of COIN operations Afghanistan. This guidance ensured that a security screening process for potential contractors was completed to confirm that the contractor was not directly linked to nefarious actors.<sup>32</sup> This at least ensured that the resources spent did not go into the adversary's pocket and addressed western politician concerns with regards to fostering corruption within that country, but it did little to help develop a better and sustainable economy.

It is clear that the vast majority of resources available for reconstruction within a counterinsurgency context come from the resources spent on the military conducting that operation. As much as direct investment is a well researched and useful approach to fight a counterinsurgency, it is still limited by the fact that it has to receive specific funding and these funds often have strings attached to them, depending on the donor. Since logistics of the counterinsurgency force, especially from western nations, will provide a significant level of funds within the country ravaged by the insurrection, it is sensible to have measures in place to ensure that these funds have the most positive impact possible in order to optimize the counterinsurgency efforts. As these funds are expanded via procurement activities and since procurement activities are normally regulated by the troop contributing nations governments, how does one harness the power of these resources to fight the insurgents?

---

<sup>31</sup> Department of National Defense, CFJP-4-0, Support (Ottawa: DND Canada, 2016), 2-19, 2-20

<sup>32</sup> Moshe Schwartz, *Wartime Contracting in Afghanistan: Analysis and Issues for Congress*: Library of Congress. Congressional Research Service, 2011. 8-9.

### **Size isn't everything, although it helps**

Understanding that it would make operational sense to target logistics spending within a counterinsurgency in such a way that the money spent not only provides the support to the force, but also optimizes the effects of the counterinsurgency fight itself is only useful if it leads to an applicable use case. In this section, evidence will be provided that, within the government of Canada contracting policy and in the Canadian Armed Forces doctrine, the authorities to do so exist and it is a matter of operationalizing it. It is, however, important to understand that, in all public procurement activities, there are other external requirements that need to be taken into consideration, such the opinion of the population. Finally, it will address the impact of the limited scale of the Canadian Armed Forces in a coalition, compared to some of its bigger allies.

On operations, the Canadian Armed Forces will likely contract all kinds of goods and services, from the purchase of construction materiel, internet services or even armed escorts for convoys.<sup>33</sup> In order to implement and manage those contracts, Canadian military and civilian members are employed both in theatre and in Canada to procure these goods and services and they must do so while respecting Government of Canada contracting policy, as well as the department's Procurement Administration Manual direction. Although both of these policy instruments are mostly written with procurement within Canada in mind, its applicability on expeditionary military operations is without restrictions.<sup>34</sup>

---

<sup>33</sup> Department of National Defense, CFJP-4-0, Support (Ottawa: DND Canada, 2016), 7-7.

<sup>34</sup> Treasury Board of Canada, *Contracting Policy*, (Ottawa: Canada Communication Group) 2017, Section 3.

The policy statement of the Government of Canada Contracting Policy does give a clear indication of how an operational commander can ensure that the procurement activities support counterinsurgency operations when it says: “Government contracting shall be conducted in a manner that will ensure the pre-eminence of operational requirements.”<sup>35</sup> This is normally expressed through a Statement of work or Statement of Requirement and the Articles of the Agreement itself and does allow the inclusion of clauses that could be targeted to economic development, such as employment of local labour, sourcing of local goods, use of local currency for payment or ensuring that procurement of said good is done in a manner that will not endanger some of the population, for example, when procuring fuel in large quantities in a devastated economy,<sup>36</sup> or promoting work in economic sectors that have long term viability within the region.

The main problem facing these decisions is often one of understanding the economic landscape in which the force is operating. Dr Morosan, associate professor at the National Defense University, does propose that, as part of the planning process, an assessment of the economic and social situation be completed to identify how it can support the deployed force, but, at the same time, to ensure that the supported force does not have a detrimental effect on the battlespace.<sup>37</sup> It should be noted that this kind of preparation should also include the look at opportunities for development as opposed to simply try to minimize damage.

---

<sup>35</sup> Ibid, Section 2.

<sup>36</sup> Department of National Defense, A-PP-005-000/AG-002, Procurement Administration manual revision 87 (Ottawa: DND Canada, March 2018), section 3.2.7.

<sup>37</sup> Marilena-Miorica Morosan, "Planning the Logistic Support at Operational Level for Nato Operations." *International Scientific Conference "Strategies XXI" 2*, (2014): 3.

Canadian Armed Forces Intelligence would be the best fit to provide the required analysis, as they have the mandate and access to the partners to be able to analyse the situation.<sup>38</sup> Olson proposes a “Reconstruction Preparation of the Battlefield” that would cover issues such as state of the local infrastructure, economic issues, state of the legal system, social issues, etc. He also proposes that it includes a surveillance plan to monitor the changes in these systems to assess progress.<sup>39</sup> Although such a task does take away collection and intelligence resources from the more kinetic part of the fight against the insurgency, economic reconstruction leads to such a large effect on the insurrection by separating the population from needing the insurgent that it should be resources accordingly.

Assessing progress of reconstruction efforts is a difficult feat to achieve. It is not enough to look at performance metric, such as the number of business created, or numbers of contracts awarded that included clauses such as the ones mentioned above. Tracking the effect of these measures is the necessary part. Dr Eustace, Director of Defence and Security Program at the Royal Canadian Military Institute, investigated the performance measurement of ISAF during the years 2005-2011 and there were 253 indicators in support of 124 desirable outcomes that were implemented in the assessment plan along the lines of security, governance, rule of law, human rights and economic and social development.<sup>40</sup> As an example, one of the key issues within this conflict was

---

<sup>38</sup> Department of National Defense, CFJP-2-0, Intelligence (Ottawa: DND Canada, 2011), 1-2 to 1-9.

<sup>39</sup> Eric T. Olson and Army War College (U.S.). Strategic Studies Institute. *Some of the Best Weapons for Counterinsurgents do Not Shoot*. Carlisle, PA: Strategic Studies Institute, U.S. Army War College, 2010, 111-112.

<sup>40</sup> Eustace, Daniel Derek and Cork University College. "State Building as Strategy: An Interrogation of NATO's Comprehensive Approach in Afghanistan between 2006 and 2011." 2014, 191.

Opium production which financed the insurrection. As such, with the measurable outcome of meeting an Afghan Government target goal of reduction of Opium production, six indicators, ranging from the size of opium production as a percent of national GDP, to having alternatives in place for farmers were measured to determine the success of the measures in place to solve this issue.<sup>41</sup> This is one example where procurement could have provided some of those alternatives measures, such as procurement of food from those farmers, to improve the chances of defeating the insurrection.

There are, however, two main issues that bring into question whether efforts should be made to further develop such a process of evaluating the environment and targeting and measuring the procurement effects to fight an insurgency for the Canadian Armed Forces. The first one is related to other Canada's interests in whatever region the military is conducting the counterinsurgency operations and the second one is one of scale of the deployed force itself.

Canada's interests are also defined in the Treasury Board Policy statement that, transparency to the Canadian public, long term economic development and compliance with Canada's trade agreements is also part of this policy statement. These requirements are above and beyond the need to meet operational requirements.<sup>42</sup> Thankfully, when it comes to transparency, Canadian Armed Forces directions are very precise as to how it shall be performed and, as long as the procurement personnel follows these directions, it

---

<sup>41</sup> Ibid 218.

<sup>42</sup> Treasury Board of Canada, *Contracting Policy*, (Ottawa: Canada Communication Group) 2017, Section 2.

should address these concerns.<sup>43</sup> When it comes to economic development, Canadian Foreign Minister Freeland mentioned as part as her foreign policy statement to the House of Commons on 6 June 2017 that stability in the international community is a in Canada's interest as a trading nation,<sup>44</sup> thus linking stability operations, of which counterinsurgency is a subset, to economic development.

When it comes to the size of Canadian contribution to counterinsurgency operations, it is important to realize that size is not everything. Even when Canada has a large contribution by its own standard, such as the contribution to the counterinsurgency in Afghanistan in the 2000s, it is dwarfed by that of its allies. In that example, Canada's contribution in monetary value peaked in 2009 and only constituted about two percent of the total contribution to the operation.<sup>45</sup> However, to go back to the concept of soft power mentioned above, this is an area where Canada can have an influence on its allies and provide leadership on this issue. Moreover, the small size of the Canadian deployments and the structure of its theatre procurement apparatus and the associated delegations of authority gives it more flexibility than its larger allies, allowing for better application of these concepts in practice.<sup>46</sup>

As was noted, although Canada does not provide the largest contribution to counterinsurgencies in comparison to its allies, it can provide a leadership role based on its soft power. Even with the restrictions in place to its procurement, the Canadian Armed

---

<sup>43</sup> Department of National Defense, A-PP-005-000/AG-002, Procurement Administration manual revision 87 (Ottawa: DND Canada, March 2018), section 3.0.

<sup>44</sup> Chrystia Freeland (speech to the House of Commons, Ottawa, Canada, 6 June 2017).

<sup>45</sup> CARINA SOLMIRANO and JAKOB HALLGREN. *Assessing the Cost of Military Operations in Afghanistan and Juxtaposing them to the Assessed Costs of Humanitarian Assistance (2008-2012)*, 7.

<sup>46</sup> Department of National Defense, A-FN-100-002/AG-006, Delegation of Authorities for Financial Administration for the Department of National Defence (DND) and the Canadian Armed Forces (CAF) (Ottawa: DND Canada, March 2018). Table.

Forces are equipped to apply the principles of supporting reconstruction through its logistical procurement in a theatre in the context of counterinsurgency operations.

Understanding the economic landscape at the part of the operation and measuring the effects throughout the campaign is critical to the success of such concept and resources do need to be associated with these requirements. The tools already exist within the Canadian Armed Forces inventory to make those changes in its approach to procurement in a counterinsurgency context and Canada could take a leadership road on that front.

### **Conclusion**

Can a western military make better use of its resources to fight insurgencies more efficiently while leveraging all the tools at its disposal? As a counterinsurgency is a fight to remove the support of the population from the insurgents, and that this support is often based on poor economic conditions, having a comprehensive approach as a solution is a sensible plan. As part of that comprehensive approach, economic reconstruction has more effect in counterinsurgency as in any other kind of conflict.<sup>47</sup> A key part of the resources available to a commander are likely to be from its logistics expenditure and, since a direct investment approach can have severe limitations on how it would be employed, and thus may have a negative effect on the legitimacy of local institutions. Adding logistical expenditures as a resources to the counterinsurgency mix is likely to be very potent, contingent to having the intelligence and collection resources supporting it.

While Canada is not going to be the largest player in a coalition, the rules and regulations covering its procurement allow for operational flexibility that may not be available to larger partners. This could ensure that the Canadian Armed Forces develop a

---

<sup>47</sup> Eric T Olson and Army War College (U.S.). Strategic Studies Institute. *Some of the Best Weapons for Counterinsurgents do Not Shoot*. Carlisle, PA: Strategic Studies Institute, U.S. Army War College, 2010

leadership role in that field when it comes to best practices in both contracting activities and its measure of effectiveness.

There are, of course, limitations associated to using logistics spending for economic development, such as the risk drawing resources away from the population that one is trying to gain to one's side, which brings even more emphasis on the economic intelligence aspect of this type of operation. There are also issues related to the speed a country can absorb economic influx and a need to ensure that this development does so in a way that legitimizes the local institutions.

As militaries try to wrestle with ways to minimize the resources needed to win their fight, more reflections are made on what does winning means. After all, in the context of current conflicts, where the line between the conflict and day to day life of the population is more and more blurred, the presence of a foreign military must be perceived as a force for good by that population and, in order to do so, a savvy military leader will do well to ensure that all its effects, intended or not, pushes towards that goal as opposed to the simple destruction of its enemy.<sup>48</sup>

---

<sup>48</sup>Jennie Carignan, "Victory as a Strategic Objective: An Ambiguous and Counter-Productive Concept for the High Command." *Canadian Military Journal* 17, no. 2 (2017): 13.

## Bibliography

- Barakat, Sultan. "The Failed Promise of Multi-Donor Trust Funds: Aid Financing as an Impediment to Effective State-Building in Post-Conflict Contexts." *Policy Studies* 30, no. 2 (2009): 107-126.
- Beckley, Michael. "Economic Development and Military Effectiveness." *Journal of Strategic Studies* 33, no. 1 (2010): 43-79.
- Beebe, Shannon D. and Mary Kaldor. *The Ultimate Weapon is no Weapon: Human Security and the New Rules of War and Peace*. New York: Public Affairs, 2010.
- Bodnar, Seth and Jeremy Gwinn. "'Monetary Ammunition' in a Counterinsurgency." *Parameters* 40, no. 3 (2010): 91.
- Brun, Brigadier General Itai. "'While You'Re Busy Making Other Plans' - the 'Other RMA'." *Journal of Strategic Studies* 33, no. 4 (2010): 535-565.
- Canada. Dept. of National Defence and Canada. Ministère de la défense nationale. *CF Information Operations*. Draft English only. ed. Ottawa: Issued on authority of the Chief of the Land Staff, Dept. of National Defence, 1998.
- Canada. *Strong, Secure, Engaged: Canada's Defence Policy*. Ottawa, Ont.: National Defence = Défense nationale, 2017.
- Canada. Department of National Defense, CFJP-4-0, Support. Ottawa: DND Canada, 2016.
- Canada. Department of National Defense, CFJP-2-0, Intelligence. Ottawa: DND Canada, 2011.
- Canada. Treasury Board of Canada, *Contracting Policy*, (Ottawa: Canada Communication Group) 2017.
- Canada. Department of National Defense, CFJP-01, Canadian Military Doctrine. Ottawa: DND Canada, 2011.
- Canada. Department of National Defense, A-FN-100-002/AG-006, Delegation of Authorities for Financial Administration for the Department of National Defence (DND) and the Canadian Armed Forces (CAF) (Ottawa: DND Canada, March 2018).
- CBC. "Should Canada risk soldiers' lives in its peacekeeping mission in Mali?", Last modified 20 March 2018. <http://www.cbc.ca/radio/thecurrent/the-current-for-march-20-2018-1.4583785/should-canada-risk-soldiers-lives-in-its-peacekeeping-mission-in-mali-1.4583883>
- Carignan, Jennie. "Victory as a Strategic Objective: An Ambiguous and Counter-Productive Concept for the High Command." *Canadian Military Journal* 17, no. 2 (2017): 5.

- Dickson, Janice, "Freeland announces 12 million for reconstruction efforts in Iraq," iPolitics, 13 February 2018. <https://ipolitics.ca/2018/02/13/freeland-announces-12-million-reconstruction-efforts-iraq/>
- Eustace, Daniel Derek and Cork University College. "State Building as Strategy: An Interrogation of NATO's Comprehensive Approach in Afghanistan between 2006 and 2011." 2014.
- Freeland, Chrystia. Speech to the House of Commons, Ottawa, Canada, 6 June 2017.
- Fund for Peace, "About the Fund For Peace", last accessed on 23 April 2018, <http://global.fundforpeace.org/aboutus>
- Fund for Peace, "Indicators", last accessed on 23 April 2018, <http://fundforpeace.org/fsi/indicators/>
- Galula, David and John A. Nagl. *Counterinsurgency Warfare : Theory and Practice*. Westport, CT: Praeger Security International, 2006.
- Hilhorst, Dorothea, Ian Christoplos, and Gemma Van Der Haar. "Reconstruction 'from Below': A New Magic Bullet Or Shooting from the Hip?" *Third World Quarterly* 31, no. 7 (2010): 1107-1124.
- Long, Joseph. "The Dry Sponge Theory: Maximizing the use of Money as a Weapon System' in Coin." *Special Warfare* 26, no. 4 (2013): 32.
- Mackinlay, John. *The Insurgent Archipelago: From Mao to Bin Laden*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2009.
- Morosan, Marilena-Miorica. "Planning the Logistic Support at Operational Level for Nato Operations." *International Scientific Conference "Strategies XXI" 2*, (2014).
- Nagaraj, Vijay Kumar. "'Beltway Bandits' and 'Poverty Barons': For-Profit International Development Contracting and the Military-Development Assemblage." *Development and Change* 46, no. 4 (2015): 585-617.
- Nye, Joseph Jr. *The Powers to Lead : Soft, Hard, and Smart*. Cary: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Nye, Joseph Jr, *Soft Power: The Means of Success in World Politics* (New York: Public Affairs, 2004), 5.
- Olson, Eric T. and Army War College (U.S.). Strategic Studies Institute. *Some of the Best Weapons for Counterinsurgents do Not Shoot*. Carlisle, PA: Strategic Studies Institute, U.S. Army War College, 2010.
- Solminaro, Carina and Jakob Hallgren. *Assessing the Cost of Military Operations in Afghanistan and Juxtaposing them to the Assessed Costs of Humanitarian Assistance (2008-2012)*.
- Trading Economics, "Afghanistan GDP", last accessed on 24 April 2018, <https://tradingeconomics.com/afghanistan/gdp>

- Schwartz, Moshe. *Wartime Contracting in Afghanistan: Analysis and Issues for Congress*. Washington: Library of Congress. Congressional Research Service, 2011.
- Serneels, Pieter and Marijke Verpoorten. "The Impact of Armed Conflict on Economic Performance: Evidence from Rwanda." *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 59, no. 4 (2015;, 2013): 555-592.
- United States. Joint Chiefs of Staff and United States. Dept. of Defense. *Capstone Concept for Joint Operations: Joint Force 2020*. Washington, D.C.: Joint Chiefs of Staff, 2013.
- Uzonwanne, Godfrey. "The Political Economy of Development in Weak States." *International Journal of Social Economics* 40, no. 1 (2012;, 2013): 4-25.
- Van Creveld, Martin. *Supplying War: Logistics from Wallenstein to Patton*. 2nd ed. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Vernon, Rebecca Rafferty, United States. Dept. of the Air Force, and George Washington University. "Battlefield Contractors: Time to Face the Tough Issues." George Washington University, 2003