

Canadian
Forces
College

Collège
des
Forces
Canadiennes



RECRUITMENT OF DIVERSE POPULATIONS STRATEGY: DRESS AND DEPARTMENT REVIEW USING AN ETHNOCULTURAL LENS

MAJOR JOSEPH FRANKLIN

JCSP 46

Service Paper

Disclaimer

Opinions expressed remain those of the author and do not represent Department of National Defence or Canadian Forces policy. This paper may not be used without written permission.

© 2020 Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada,
as represented by the Minister of National Defence.

PCEMI 46

Étude militaire

Avertissement

Les opinions exprimées n'engagent que leurs auteurs et ne reflètent aucunement des politiques du Ministère de la Défense nationale ou des Forces canadiennes. Ce papier ne peut être reproduit sans autorisation écrite.

© 2020 Sa Majesté la Reine du Chef du Canada,
représentée par le ministre de la Défense nationale.

CANADIAN FORCES COLLEGE – COLLÈGE DES FORCES CANADIENNES

JCSP 46 – PCEMI 46

2019 – 2020

SERVICE PAPER - ÉTUDE MILITAIRE

**RECRUITMENT OF DIVERSE POPULATIONS STRATEGY:
DRESS AND DEPARTMENT REVIEW USING AN ETHNOCULTURAL LENS**

Major Joseph Franklin

“This paper was written by a candidate attending the Canadian Forces College in fulfillment of one of the requirements of the Course of Studies. The paper is a scholastic document, and thus contains facts and opinions which the author alone considered appropriate and correct for the subject. It does not necessarily reflect the policy or the opinion of any agency, including the Government of Canada and the Canadian Department of National Defence. This paper may not be released, quoted or copied, except with the express permission of the Canadian Department of National Defence.”

Word Count: 2,186

« La présente étude a été rédigée par un stagiaire du Collège des Forces canadiennes pour satisfaire à l'une des exigences du cours. L'étude est un document qui se rapporte au cours et contient donc des faits et des opinions que seul l'auteur considère appropriés et convenables au sujet. Elle ne reflète pas nécessairement la politique ou l'opinion d'un organisme quelconque, y compris le gouvernement du Canada et le ministère de la Défense nationale du Canada. Il est défendu de diffuser, de citer ou de reproduire cette étude sans la permission expresse du ministère de la Défense nationale. »

Nombre de mots : 2.186

RECRUITMENT OF DIVERSE POPULATIONS STRATEGY: DRESS AND DEPARTMENT REVIEW USING AN ETHNO-CULTURAL LENS

AIM

1. Canadian military uniforms are recognized to be not only functional but to also have connections to military history and heritage. Canadian military dress and department standards have a strong British/European influence and have been modified over time following Human Rights challenges and to better accommodate women. As they exist currently, there is little room for expression of ethnocultural identity within the Canadian Armed Forces (CAF) dress and department standards. The standards effectively communicate that service in the CAF is contingent upon cultural assimilation or, at the very least, that ethnocultural diversity is less valued than military uniformity. The slow and piecemeal approach currently employed for dress and department policy changes reflects an organizational resistance to embracing diversity and inclusiveness. This is at odds with Canada's policy of multiculturalism which supports the maintenance of cultural identities.¹

2. Canadian population demographic trends indicate that the CAF will have to be successful in attracting ethnoculturally diverse Canadians in order to achieve its assigned tasks. Thus the CAF must commit to diversity and inclusiveness. This service paper aims to persuade the Commander of Personnel Command that a comprehensive modernization of the dress and department standards is a required component of a CAF diversity and inclusiveness strategy which will support the successful recruitment of ethnoculturally diverse Canadians..

INTRODUCTION

¹ Gagnon, Erica, Jan Raska, Lindsay Van Dyk, Monica MacDonald, and Steve Schwinghamer. "Canadian Multiculturalism Policy, 1971," last accessed 23 October 2019, <https://pier21.ca/research/immigration-history/canadian-multiculturalism-policy-1971>.

3. Strong, Secure, Engaged: Canada's Defence Policy (SSE), was released in 2017 with a strong emphasis on personnel policies and initiatives. Within SSE, the Government identified Canada's diverse and multicultural population as a national strength that could be leveraged to drive innovation. It implied that the CAF should direct recruiting efforts towards diverse ethnocultural groups in order to exploit the potential benefits to the organization. The defence policy explicitly directs decision-makers by stating that "this includes reinforcing diversity in the *identity* [for emphasis] of the Canadian Armed Forces."² To date, the CAF has not achieved federally mandated employee diversity targets. Several reasons have been suggested to account for the lack of success. The reasons vary amongst the different ethnocultural groups and involve issues of varying complexity that will require novel approaches and flexibility to adequately address.³

4. According to 2016 Canadian census data, between the years 2011 and 2016, the majority of new immigrants to Canada came from Asia (including the Middle East). Using complex population models, Statistics Canada was able to make projections about ethnocultural diversity and to identify population trends into the future. Their findings indicate that future immigrants to Canada will continue to originate primarily from non-European countries and that Canadian society will continue to become more ethnoculturally diverse up to 2050.⁴ These population trends have implications for CAF recruitment. Particularly, it identifies a requirement for recruitment strategies that will be effective in attracting diverse populations.

5. The CAF has attempted to increase the proportion of women in uniform since the passage of the Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms in 1982.⁵ Limited success has been achieved,

² Department of National Defence. *Strong Secure Engaged: Canada's Defence Policy* (Ottawa: Canadian Defence Academy, 2017), 23.

³ The Canadian Press. "Our Population doesn't look like all white guys," last Modified 25 June 2017, <https://nationalpost.com/news/canada/with-wider-search-for-soldiers-canadas-military-broadens-horizons>Gagnon.

⁴ Singh, Aishwarya. "From 2011 to 2036 - Canada: A Look at Ethnocultural Diversity and Immigration", Simon Fraser University, SFU Public Square (blog), 23 Feb 2017.

⁵ *The Canadian Charter of Human Rights - Constitution Act* (1982), "Section 15(1) Every individual is equal before and under the law and has the right to the equal protection and equal benefit of the law without

however, the CAF has not developed effective strategies to attract and retain enough women to meet its gender diversity targets. Informed by the challenges and lessons learned in trying to increase the representation of women, the CAF will have to identify and remove any potential barriers to the recruitment of Canadians from the full spectrum of ethnoculturally diverse Canadians. To increase the attractiveness of a career in the CAF amongst new ethnoculturally diverse Canadians, it is important to transmit messages that communicate welcome and inclusiveness.

6. An effective manner of communicating welcome and inclusiveness is through the targeted deployment of images of ethnoculturally relatable CAF personnel on duty, in uniform and wearing culturally appropriate accessories or culturally specific hair-styles. These types of images will enhance the ability of new Canadians to relate to, or identify with, the CAF. While these images will open the minds of new Canadians to consideration of a military career, they will also help to dispel concerns of ethnocultural erasure that might be associated with enrolling in the CAF. This service paper will outline the legal responsibilities and moral obligations that support the implementation of a review of CAF dress and deportment regulations. Further, this paper will address concerns about losing elements of the CAF's history and heritage as well as provide recommendations for the implementation of an objective review and update of existing dress and deportment policies.

DISCUSSION

7. As a federal institution, the CAF is required to make accommodations for ethnic and cultural groups. CAF members should be allowed to maintain their cultural identities whenever possible. The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms prohibits discrimination based on specific concepts and establishes a right for all Canadians to not experience discrimination,

discrimination and, in particular, without discrimination based on race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, sex, age or mental or physical disability.”

regardless of national heritage or ethnicity.⁶ Cultural freedom, described as the freedom to retain and express a person's cultural heritage in Canadian society has been assured by federal policy since 1971, through federal multiculturalism policies. Multiculturalism "refer[s] to an ideal of equality and mutual respect among a population's ethnic or cultural groups"⁷ and is the basis of the federal Multiculturalism Act.⁸ The Multiculturalism Act set Canada's position on immigrant integration as one of accommodation rather than assimilation.

8. The Employment Equity Act (EEA) legislated the application of affirmative action practices in Canadian federal institutions, including the CAF. Its intention is to "achieve equality in the workplace so that no [woman, Aboriginal person, person with disability, or member of a visible minority group] ... is denied employment opportunities or benefits for reasons unrelated to ability."⁹ The EEA officially recognized that in order to achieve equity, "special measures and the accommodation of differences"¹⁰ were required. The Act made the accommodation of differences an employer obligation, with few exceptions.

9. The CAF utilizes policies and regulations as instruments of control meant to guide behaviour and safeguard the legitimacy of the Canadian military. These policies and regulations reflect a collection of values taken from various relevant concepts such as legal values, civic values, morale values, and civic nationalism amongst others. Civic nationalism describes a community model of "equal, rights-bearing citizens, united in patriotic attachment to a shared set of political values and practices - regardless of race, colour, religion, language, gender, sexual

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ Jean Burnet and Leo Driedger, "Multiculturalism," last modified 10 September 2014, <https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/multiculturalism>

⁸ Jeffrey G. Reitz, "Multiculturalism policies and popular multiculturalism in the development of Canadian Immigration," in *The Multiculturalism Question: Debating Identity in 21st Century Canada*, ed. Jack Jedwab, (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2014), 110-111.

⁹ *Employment Equity Act* (1995), "(b) instituting such positive policies and practices and making such reasonable accommodations as will ensure that persons in designated groups achieve a degree of representation in each occupational group in the employer's workforce that reflects their representation in (i) the Canadian workforce"

¹⁰ Ibid.

orientation, or ethnic origin.”¹¹ This is significant because it speaks to the implicit organizational belief in equality, and in particular, equality regardless of ethnic or racial differences. By virtue of their origins, CAF policies and regulations should be in harmony with the previously discussed federal laws.

10. Since 2017 the CAF has issued SSE and the Canadian Armed Forces Diversity Strategy. SSE declared that the CAF is committed to “striving for gender equality and building a workforce that leverages the diversity of Canadian society.”¹² “Diversity” is described by the CAF as the “respect for and appreciation of differences in ethnicity, language, gender, age, national origin, disabilities, sexual orientation, training and religion.”¹³ This CAF definition for diversity is an aggregate of the concepts of both diversity and inclusion and indicates that the CAF supports adoption of both of these concepts.¹⁴ According to the Canadian Centre for Diversity and Inclusion, while inclusion strives to create a culture that “respects, accepts and values difference[s]”, similar to the the concept of accommodation, the combined concepts of diversity and inclusion “is about capturing the uniqueness of the individual; creating an environment that values and respects individuals for their talents, skills and abilities to the benefit of the collective.”¹⁵

11. Canadian federal laws and policies prohibit discrimination based on national heritage or ethnicity and establish a federal policy of cultural accommodation. In efforts to achieve equality

¹¹ Department of National Defence, *Leadership in the Canadian Forces - Conceptual Foundations* (Ottawa: Canadian Defence Academy, 2013), 22.

¹² Department of National Defence, *Strong Secure Engaged: Canada’s Defence Policy* (Ottawa: Canadian Defence Academy, 2017), xx.

¹³ Department of National Defence, *Canadian Armed Forces Diversity Strategy*, (Ottawa: Canadian Defence Academy, 2017), 1.

¹⁴ Canadian Centre for Diversity and Inclusion. “Diversity defined”, accessed 22 October 2019. <https://ccdi.ca/our-story/diversity-defined/> “**Diversity** is about the individual. It is about the variety of unique dimensions, qualities and characteristics we all possess. **Inclusion** is about the collective. It is about creating a culture that strives for equity and embraces, respects, accepts and values difference. **Diversity and Inclusion** is about capturing the uniqueness of the individual; creating an environment that values and respects individuals for their talents, skills and abilities to the benefit of the collective.”

¹⁵ *Ibid.*

in the workforce, federal law obliges the CAF to accommodate for difference related to ethnicity. CAF policies and regulations are clear in their prohibition of discrimination. However, the dress and deportment regulations are inconsistent with federal policies in that they do not acknowledge the federal obligation for accommodation.

12. The CAF has a moral obligation to accommodate ethnocultural diversity. The Charter of Rights and Freedoms makes it clear that discrimination on the basis of “race, national or ethnic origin, colour, religion, sex, age or mental or physical disability”¹⁶ is prohibited. The concept of civic nationalism which is included in the foundational values of military policies and regulations, is based on the principle that all citizens are rights-bearing and equally valued.¹⁷ Although CAF members have special responsibilities with respect to Canadian society, they are still citizens. As all Canadians are equally valued and have rights, such as to not be subjected to discrimination, then the CAF should refrain from instituting policies or regulations that would be deemed biased on the basis of race, ethnicity, culture, or gender. Additionally, policies and regulations that disproportionately affect one group relative to another should be evaluated to ensure they are not codified institutional discrimination. Examples of such questionable policies include the authorization to continue wearing a beard being contingent upon the subjective opinion of a senior NCM (disproportionately affect members of Asian descent), restriction of cornrow hair styles to women (disproportionately affects Black men), prohibition of nasal jewellery (disproportionately affects people of South-Asian descent), restrictions on the size, number and material of jewellery items outside of circumstances where safety concerns exist and even when dressed in civilian clothing on duty (arbitrary and disproportionately affects women).

13. Canadian society values multiculturalism (accommodation of cultural freedom), freedom of expression and freedom of choice above strict uniformity. Accordingly, any decision to prioritize strict uniformity above the three identified superior Canadian values should be

¹⁶ *The Canadian Charter of Human Rights - Constitution Act* (1982).

¹⁷ Department of National Defence, *Leadership in the Canadian Forces - Conceptual Foundations* (Ottawa: Canadian Defence Academy, 2013), 21.

rationally justified. When conditions that warrant limitation of cultural freedom, freedom of expression or freedom of choice no longer exist, freedoms should be re-established in deference to Canadian society's values prioritization. As an institution that must reflect the values of the society it serves, the CAF has a moral obligation to accommodate for cultural freedom, and to allow for freedom of expression and freedom of choice when permissive conditions exist. A philosophy of flexibility should therefore be considered for aspects of dress and deportment that do not impact mission effectiveness.

CONCLUSION

14. The CAF is currently out of step with federal Canadian policies with respect to ethnocultural accommodation. This is particularly evident in its resistance to changes in dress and deportment regulations. Canadian population demographic trends clearly demonstrate that the CAF will need to make itself attractive to diverse population groups in order to deliver the capabilities identified in SSE. The Canadian Armed Forces Diversity Strategy represents a recognition and desire to address this significant issue. The gravity of this challenge demands that the CAF works comprehensively to both remove barriers and find solutions.

15. Concerns about the erosion of the “military identity” may be at the root of resistance to establishing a military culture that embraces ethnocultural accommodation. Acceptance of ethnocultural accommodation within a military organization is based on the theory of multiple identities. This theory holds that a person can possess more than one identity where one identity does not diminish the fullness of any other identity.¹⁸ If it is accepted that a person can be both a loving spouse and an effective city councillor without one identity rendering the other identity less robust, than it should be accepted that a person can be both an effective military member and an culturally-intact ethnic Canadian.

RECOMMENDATION

16. It is recommended that the CAF fulfill its obligation to accommodate for ethnocultural diversity whenever reasonably possible, as required by the EEA. Further, it is recommended that a comprehensive modernization of the CAF dress and deportment regulations be conducted. Modernization should aim to eliminate all gender biased, racially biased, religiously biased, ethnoculturally biased, and arbitrary regulations. Modernization will allow the CAF to advertise itself in a manner that would convey the message that the CAF values, respects and embraces diversity and is an inclusive organization that welcomes all Canadians to serve their country.

¹⁸ Erik H. Erikson, *Childhood and Society (2nd Ed)* (New York: Norton, 1963) xx.

Modernization will certainly improve the image of the CAF as a potential employer in ethnically diverse communities. Modernization of the dress and deportment regulations should be part of the larger strategy to improve the success in recruitment of ethnoculturally diverse Canadians. Modernization of the dress and deportment policies and regulations would improve the image of the CAF, recasting it as an accommodating organization. It will support the image of the CAF as a modern, socially conscious and progressive organization.

17. It is recommended that the task of reviewing existing dress and deportment regulations for opportunities to better accommodate ethnocultural diversity and to remove biased and arbitrary regulations be completed by a primarily civilian committee. The committee should be chaired by a military member and include civilian academics with expertise in ethnocultural studies, gender studies, religious studies, and military history and heritage. The committee shall make recommendations for changes to the CAF dress and deportment regulations that will make the rules more inclusive and accommodating. The recommendations will be presented to a panel of environmental Chief Warrant Officers where each recommendation will be discussed. All committee recommendations should be accepted unless it can be demonstrated that a legitimate risk of security or safety would result or the cost of accommodation would be excessively high. The final list of recommendations for dress and deportment policy and regulation changes should be reviewed by Diversity Champions and then forwarded to the final DND approval by authority.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Burnet, Jean and Leo Driedger. "Multiculturalism." Last modified 10 September 2014.
<https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/multiculturalism>

Canada, Department of National Defence. *Strong Secure Engaged: Canada's Defence Policy*. Ottawa: Canadian Defence Academy, 2017.

———. *Canadian Armed Forces Diversity Strategy*. Ottawa: Canadian Defence Academy, 2017.

———. *Strong Secure Engaged: Canada's Defence Policy*. Ottawa: Canadian Defence Academy, 2017.

———. *Leadership in the Canadian Forces - Conceptual Foundations*. Ottawa: Canadian Defence Academy, 2013.

Canada. *Employment Equity Act*. 1995.

———. *The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*. 1982.

Canadian Centre for Diversity and Inclusion. "Diversity Defined." Last accessed 23 October 2019. <https://ccdi.ca/our-story/diversity-defined/>.

Erickson, E. H. *Childhood and Society (2nd Ed)*. New York: Norton, 1963.

Gagnon, Erica, Jan Raska, Lindsay Van Dyk, Monica MacDonald, and Steve Schwinghamer. "Canadian Multiculturalism Policy, 1971." Last accessed 23 October 2019.
<https://pier21.ca/research/immigration-history/canadian-multiculturalism-policy-1971>.

Reitz, Jeffrey G. "Multiculturalism policies and popular multiculturalism in the development of Canadian Immigration." In *The Multiculturalism Question: Debating Identity in 21st Century Canada*, edited by Jack Jedwab, 110-111. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2014.

The Canadian Press. "Our Population doesn't look like all white guys." Last Modified 25 June 2017. <https://nationalpost.com/news/canada/with-wider-search-for-soldiers-canadas-military-broadens-horizonsGagnon>.